



វេទិកានៃអង្គការមិនមែនរដ្ឋាភិបាល ស្តីពីកម្ពុជា
The NGO Forum on Cambodia

ធ្វើការរួមគ្នាដើម្បីការប្រសើរឡើង
Working Together for Positive Change

MINUTE OF QUARTERLY MEMBER MEETING



Friday 26th April 2013

Cambodia-Japan Cooperation Center (CJCC)

MINUTES OF THE NGO FORUM'S QUARTERLY MEMBERS MEETING

Friday 26th April 2013 from 8:00 – 12:00AM

*Venue: Cambodia-Japan Cooperation Center (CJCC)
IFL Building, Russian Federation Blvd., Phnom Penh, Cambodia*



The NGO Forum on Cambodia organized its second Quarterly Members Meeting in 2013 on Friday 26th April 2013 at CJCC's meeting room from 8:00am-12:00am. There are 145 (women 50) participants, who are NGOs member, NGOs Sector, and Networks of the NGO Forum have participated in this meeting.

1. Welcome remark by chairperson of the meeting

Mr. Sun Youra, Executive Director of My Village Organization (MVi) and member of Management Committee of the NGO Forum on Cambodia has been chaired this meeting and started the meeting by introduce and inform the meeting about the input of all members, currently more than 300 members have been assisted for 5 years stratgic plan (2014-201ambodia. Moreover, he briefed other output of NGOF such as conducted public dialogue on EIA, agriculture land and support to government policies consultation. For next quarter, NGOF together with members will conduct policies dialogue on national strategy plan and need support from all members. Today, there will be topics to be discussed as mainly on a). the National Policy on Green Development, b). the National Strategic Plan on Green Development 2013-2030 and c). Green Growth Development as well as on draft law of Environment Impact Assessment (EIA). Speakers of the meeting and panel discussion were invited to the meeting as the following:



- **H.E. Dr. Chhun Vannak**, Secretary General of the National Strategic Plan on Green Development of the Ministry of Environment - The National Policy on Green Development and the National Strategic Plan on Green Development 2013-2030.
- **Dr. Tan Monivann**, Deputy Director General of Mong Reththy Group Co., Ltd - Experiences of green development program implementation in Cambodia.
- **Mr. Tek Vannara**, Deputy Executive Director in Charge of Programmes of the NGO Forum on Cambodia - Overview of NGO and CSO on Green Growth.
- **Mr. Chhith Sam Ath**, Executive Director of the NGO Forum on Cambodia, on the results of the civil society consultation process on EIA draft law.
- **Mrs. Nhim Borany**, Ratanakiri affected community representative - experiences of affected community to the past implemented of environment impact assessment
- **Mrs. Chan Sokyeng**, Development Issue Programme Manager of the NGO Forum on Cambodia will give an updates on the process of the CSO comments to the National Strategic Development Plan 2014-2018 and the planned political forum.

2. Activities and results of meeting

2.1 Presentation on National policy on Green development and the National Strategic Plan on Green Development 2013-2030 (H.E Dr. Chhun Vannak).

There were three main topics have been presented by H.E Dr. Chhun Vannak and he elaborated each topic as the following:

Green Growth vision – the vision of the growth is to eradicate poverty of the country and enhance and ensure inclusive, equitable, coherent and balanced sustainable development of Cambodia. Furthermore green growth will promote low-carbon growth and climate resilient development, which need knowledge, awareness and education to all stakeholders within country. For instance, this growth will also promote bilateral and multilateral for Green Growth cooperation. However, the main focus of the growth is to increase ecosystem services payment as well as mitigate and adapt to climate change situation, which is now happening as global issues.

Cambodia National Green Growth Roadmap – to be clear for all participants in the meeting, H.E. Dr. Chhun Vannak has shared his presentation focused on road map of Cambodia green growth, which pointed out seven key priorities accesses for people of Cambodia as the following:

- i. **Access** to water resources management and sanitation;
- ii. **Access** to food security (agriculture) and non-chemical products;
- iii. **Access** to sustainable land use;
- iv. **Access** to renewable energy and energy efficiency;
- v. **Access** to information and knowledge;
- vi. **Access** to means for better mobility and
- vii. **Access** to finance and investments

At the global level, Cambodia represented by Ministry of Environment has been collaborated in signing an MOU with Global Green Growth Institute (GGGI) represented by Republic of Korea in May 2011 with 18 member countries. As the results, Cambodia has become a member country of the GGGI as an international organization.

At the national level, Cambodia has established National Policy and strategic plan on Green Growth 2013-2030, aiming at developing the economy with consideration for environmental and natural resources sustainability. The national policy, compiled by the ministry of environment, aims to balance between economic development and environment, society, culture and sustainable consumption of natural resources in order to enhance people's well-being and living conditions.

The strategic plan for green growth 2013-2030 is to promote Cambodian economy towards the green economy, focusing on effective use of natural resources, environmental sustainability, green jobs, green technologies, green finance, green credit, and green investment. H.E. Dr. Chhun Vannak has explained that the country has already adopted several legal instruments for the green growth implementation. Those included the roadmap for green growth, the memorandum of understanding on green growth cooperation between Cambodia and South Korea's Global Green Growth Institute (GGGI), the National Council of Green Growth, and Cambodia's membership into an agreement on the establishment of the GGGI. The GGGI was officially launched in March 2010 by former President of South Korea Lee Myung-bak. Its core activity is advising member countries on forming a Green Growth Plan (GGP). Last but not least, Cambodia need to prioritize key sectors for the enhancement of green economy and sustainable development of Cambodia include food security, water security, energy security, clean production and a zero waste product life cycle, together with sustainable consumption and production life-cycle approach. Finally the achieving of Cambodia Millennium Development Goals, while enhancing national green growth implementation by integrating the Green Growth Paradigm into the four dimensions of Cambodia's sustainable development or green growth, i.e. economy, environment, society and culture and balancing the development of the four pillars with each other in a coherent manner.

2.2 Experiences of green development program implementation in Cambodia - Dr. Tan Monivann, Deputy Director General of Mong Reththy Group Co., Ltd.

Some background of MRT group has been shared to all participants by explaining that MRT has now 10 other companies, which is join venture with MRT. The group focused on import and export,

business, real estate and agriculture and agro-industry. There were land concession has been granted to the group by government for 194,000 ha to invest in coconut oil, which 15000 ha has been used/planted the trees. The concession will last 70 years. The objectives of the investment are to do business on coconut oil, agriculture, agri-business and coconut oil processing as well as import export career.

Aside from business, MRT group contribute a lot to environment protection example the group contributed fund to forest preservation as the results numbers of hectares of forest has been preserved by the company. This is showed that MRT has contributed a lot to the green development in the country. Moreover, MRT group established another project on pig raising/production in order to meet the demand and supply of food consumption in Cambodia as well as reduce the importation of live pig from other countries. This MPIC Company plays very important roles in pig production industry in Cambodia and in Asia. From pig waste, company has produced bio-gas in order to produced 1MW of electricity to supply in the areas of farmers. Bio-gas can be used for agriculture purposes such on rice, rubber and others crop.

2.3 Overview of NGO and CSO on Green Growth - Mr. Tek Vannara, Deputy Executive Director in Charge of Programme of the NGO Forum on Cambodia.

He has share an overview of NGO and CSO on Green Growth by presenting his slides focused on sustainable development, which need to think about economic development, social development, environment protection and green development initiated by South Korea. After he explained this concept, an example of the green growth from Mondul Kiri has been shared to all participants focused on the recent changed in this province.



From natural forest to Forest plantation (rubber planting, ...); agro industry (potatoes, cashew nut; LECs, mining company; hydro power on Sre Pork river areas, GMS development (GMS 1992) and the change from shifting agriculture to permanent farm. As the results, challenges together with opportunity for people in Mondul Kiri such as:

- Opportunity: has extra occupation, increasing knowledge, Communication and social service become better off as well as infrastructure.
- Challenges: Knowledge is limited; lack of experiences (skill, technical experiences), job competent, exchange of cultural, pressure on natural resource use and its degradation.

Last but not least, he shared to all participants on results of IUCN congress conducted on 6th -15th September 2013 in Jeju Island, South Korea, which participated by 10,000 people, 5,000 expert of 153 countries with 600 small events. The objective of the congress is to share information and experience regarding conservation issues and find out mechanism to improve to future. As the results, the following main topics have been discussed in the congress:

- Nature + people and governance
- Nature + development
- Nature + food
- Nature + climate

Open discussion:



- **Mr. Pen Sokhon**, Director of NREDO from Stoeung Treng Province: suggested to add more green development plan, I think the 7 priority policies is really good but I would like to suggested adding 8th priority on access to information because it is so importance.
- **Ms. Keo Navann**, Office Manager of AFSC - My question is director to H.E. Dr. Chhun Vannak: Related to solar cooker, does government have and contributed to people both rural and urban areas because this is quite interesting of many people.
- **Mr. Ek Visarakhun**, President of CMFE from Kampong Thom Province: I have seen in newspaper stated that “Cambodia is crime of forestry”. On behalf of government, NGOs and private sectors how would you all participate to stop forest destroy? On the other hand, I’d like suggested, if possible abolish any illegal forester company that can use the model of fisheries sector in abolishing all fishing lot.

Clarification: H.E. Dr. Chhun Vannak: I think access information and knowledge is already include in the priority and this is related to international commitment but Cambodia itself need to pledge to implement all kind of thing. Related to cooker was a demo project supported by neighbor Cambodia funded by JJI. The demo is located in Samrong district Takeo province. However, cost of this technology is so expensive and will fall into private sector responsibility.

2.4 Presentation on results of the civil society consultation process on EIA draft law by Mr. Chhith Sam Ath, Executive Director of the NGO Forum on Cambodia.

He presented background of draft law on EIA, which happened for long time ago. This law focused on the impact on people and report of EIA. There are 18 chapter and 81 articles to ensure sound law and minimize negative impact on people and environment. Public dialogue has been conducted and some of potential of main points in the law have been focused as the following:

- Introduce of guideline on environment protection e.g preparedness to impact
- Initial environmental assessment and the process of environmental protection agreement.
- Potential date of certification on IEA report not more than 5 years (at first draft no time limited) article 22.
- Encourage on public participation and public announcement on EIA report



- Include trans boundary EIA
- EIA monitoring by outsider (External environment auditor)
- 1% of investment fund need to be contributed as social and environmental fund
- Include guideline of agreement freely with evident base (FPIC) article 25
- Included right to participate access to information and fair
- Included climate change issues in the draft law

Comments to be adjusted/added in the draft law:

- Public consultation should be conducted more than one time and fully participation on decision making.
- Publicize of project and EIA report should be conducted national wide and not only on web page but public location and impact of project sites.
- Verification of report and public consultation should be increased from 60 to 90 days (article 16).
- Role and responsibility was not included publics is complainant
- Sharing information on web page is difficult for community and local authority
- The information in this draft law was not properly conducted before the law drafted
- Written was complicated especially participation guideline
- Availability of finding justice right to participate and right to access. However, our concern is the ideas of community are not considered.
- This draft law should be participated by regional and neighboring countries to avoid duplicate of law in the region.
- Should mention the collaboration as partners with CSO government private sector and community in the case of any emergencies issues.
- Time provided to CSO for comments is too short
- Some of report was just copied and paste
- The approval report was never shared with CSO and the publics.
- Members of inter-ministries do not have enough time to verify technical aspect of impact mitigation and environmental plan.
- Community suggestion do not captured and recorded well enough and take fully consideration.
- Community suggestion and issues do not bring up to be discussed in inter-ministries meeting.

Suggestion to improve EIA:

- Increased time to verify and check EIA report at least 90 days of working day.
- All comment and community suggestion should be recorded well and bring up to be discussed.
- Final report should be shared to the public's especially to local level
- Avoid duplicate report and copy and paste without deeply analysis
- Regular monitoring of plan implementation should be prospered
- Completely avoid implement project without EIA report
- The public's should be fully participated in each stage of EIA process

Next step:

- NGOF together with partners will organize consultation workshop for 2 days (29-30 April 2013) on EIA and will be participated by local and international NGO, community representative, development partners and others stakeholders.
- Continue mobilize national and international expert to help provide comments and technical suggestion.
- All comments will be consolidated and send to MoE for verification and further comments.

- NGO and its members are warmly well come to work and assist/support government to consult with all stakeholders in the mean to improve its meaning deeply for effective implementation.

2.5 Experiences of affected community to the past implemented of environment impact assessment by Mrs. Nhim Borany, Ratanak Kiri affected community representative.

We, community are concerning that if hydro is built at upstream will impact on my country. In case built in Cambodia what are the impacts you can imagine. Suggest government if can stop building or postpone the construction. As for example, Yali dam really impact on our livelihood such as animal, houses lost. If any others option that government can construct in others location. Related to ELCs not sure there is license or not we have no information access to. We do not have land to expand. Flooding happened to us every year we concern in our future through our experiences. We at upstream no eligible to receive compensate but only who live in dam areas. We are happy the development of government but please see our people concern. I understood that people at city may not meet concern like us so I suggest have other choices.



Open discussion:

- **Question: Mr. Kang Samnang, Coordinator of KKKHRDA from Kampong Speu province:** what is your method to advocate in your case of dam construction?
- **Answer:** issues the joint statement and send to national assembly because we are impacted of dam. We had organized forum within village and submitted report and statement to national assembly but no reply yet.
- **Question: Mr. Pen Sokhon, Director of NREDO from Stoeung Treng province:** what is your option to use energy if no dam?
- **Answer:** I think solar and small dam with no impact or little impact. In case construct should have compensation with reasonable cost.

2.6 Updates on the process of the CSO comments to the National Strategic Development Plan 2014-2018 and the planned political forum.

Mrs. Chan Sokyeng, Development Issue Programme Manager of the NGO Forum on Cambodia has given an updates on the process of the CSO comments to the National Strategic Development Plan 2014-2018 and the planned to conduct political forum. On the other hand, she has shared with participants on NSPD deadline of each step and provided some importance thought on how CSO will engage the process.



Why should CSOs/NGOs engage in the formulation of NSDP 2014-2018:

- Country ownership of such a major policy framework goes beyond government ownership
- CSO participation should include information sharing, dialogues, collaboration in implementation programs and participatory monitoring and evaluation. Through this, CSO/NGOs can play an **important role in developing the NSDP 2014-2018.**

CSO/NGOs participate in this preparation process of NSDP 2014-2018:

- **Communicate CSO/NGO inputs directly with respective LMs/LAs and development partners** through dedicated discussions on NSDP 2014-2018 preparation in all Technical Working Groups (TWGs) and any other possible avenues; and

- **Participate in a sector-based CSO/NGO perspective on the key aspects of the NSDP 2014-18**, to be facilitated by the NGO Forum on Cambodia (NGOF) through its Development Issues Forum (DIF). This will collectively provide important perspectives to the RGC for consideration before further decisions are taken.
- The key points that individual sector CSO/NGOs should include but not be limited to, are:
 - o CSO/NGO views on the contents and progress of the NSDP Update (2009-2013);
 - o Key aspects and areas of improvement that CSO/NGOs wish to see in the NSDP 2014-2018; and
 - o Key areas where CSO/NGOs' role and participation could be highlighted

3. Meeting Summary and Closing Remark

At the end of meeting, **Mr. Sun Yura**, Chairperson of the meeting have summed up the brief conclusion of a morning meeting result. Thee main topics were presented and took into consideration of all participant. In the meeting, we came up with different speakers. H.E **Dr. Chhun Vannak** who put much effort to present on National Policy on Green Development and the National Strategic Plan on Green Development 2013-2030. As the following time, **Dr. Tan Monivann** provided the crucial experience in Experiences of green development program implementation in Cambodia, some concerns and suggestion for conservation. In addition, the most important point was the result of the overview of NGO and CSO on Green Growth presented by **Mr. Tek Vannara**. In the meantime, we are also informed about the impact of hydropower construction on community who live upstream and downstream of the project site. Last but not least, **Mr. Chhith Sam Ath**, Executive Director of the NGO Forum on Cambodia, presented on the results of the civil society consultation process on EIA draft law. Finally Mr. Sun Yura expressed gratitude and wish to all participant with good luck and success for working performance and close of the meeting.

---End---