

**Compilation of NGO Submissions to
Line Ministries/Agencies
as the NGO Comments on the
First Draft NSDP Update 2009-2013**

Compiled during February 2010 by:
The NGO Forum on Cambodia
Development Policy Project
Email: ngoforum@ngoforum.org.kh
Tel: 023 – 214 429

Contents

1. Land Reform	3
2. Forestry Reform.....	30
3. Agriculture sector	33
4. Fisheries	35
5. Mining and its Environmental Impact	39
6. Extractive Industry Revenue Management	47
7. Access to Information	51
8. Good Governance/ Anti-Corruption	53
9. Child Right	56
10. Hydropower Development and Energy Sector.....	58
11. Environment Protection, Conservation and Climate Change.....	65
12. Aid Effectiveness	72
13. Inclusion of disability	74
14. Public Financial Reform and Budget Allocation	87
15. Inclusion of the National Audit Authority's Achievement, Challenges, Strategic Plan	89
16. Inclusion Disaster Risk Reduction	90
17. Education Sector.....	93

1. Land Reform

Page*	Para-number**	Original Text from the first draft NSDP Update 2009-2013	NGO Comment
	104	The Royal Government recognizes that land reform is vital to enhance social stability, the development of an efficient land market, environmental sustainability, and for increasing agricultural productivity through the issuance of land titles to the citizens; in particular, to farmers who are cultivating land that they occupy. Issuing land titles to citizens is vital for improving the management of land use, especially the management of state owned lands, to ensure security of land tenure in a transparent and equitable manner, and to further reduce poverty by enabling citizens to have access to financial markets by using their land titles as collateral. It was estimated in 2001 that there are 6-7 million parcels of land (plot) for which land titles have to be issued.	The figure which has shown land title about 6-7 million parcels of land (plot) over country which was estimated in 2001 is not fairly equal to the recent population's need and demand. The land registration mechanism is apparently not functioned properly which can cause land registration less effective to attain the above estimated number.
	106	Significant progress has been made in <i>issuing land titles</i> . So far, 1,664,297 land titles have been issued, of which 3/4 are rural lands and 1/4 are urban lands. Of these, 1,070,665 titles were issued through systematic land titling process whilst 593,645 titles were issued through sporadic titling. To-date the land titling process has, therefore, covered between 23 and 24 percent of total land plots (6-7 million) throughout the Kingdom. The targets set for the issuance of land titles in the Cambodian Millennium Development Goals (CMDGs) for the year 2010 is the registration of 32 percent of total land parcels (plots) – of which 24 percent are set for lands owned by farmers. The CMDGs targets for 2015 are registration of 65 percent of total land parcels (plots) – of which 48.75 percent are the land parcels (plots)	<p>So far, land registration has done more primarily in rural areas than in urban areas (3/ 4 % in rural and 1/4% in urban) which most of the land are rice paddy fields and belong to farmers, so this does not consume much time to tackle conflict arising during the registration processes.</p> <p>We would suggest speeding up land registration in urban areas as fast as in rural areas in the yearly plans of the MLMUPC so that the land conflict which is a hot issue in the society can minimize and at the same time, allow people to use their land for production activities for both daily survival and poverty reduction.</p>

		owned by farmers. Of the total land titles issued so far, 70 percent are for common property of couples, 20 percent are for property owned by women, 5 percent are for personal property owned by men, and another 5 percent are for property owned by monasteries.	
	110	To further strengthen <i>land management</i> , the process of establishing policy framework and relevant regulatory frameworks such as land management policy, national housing policy, guidelines on legal procedures for resettlement, and law on land management, urbanization and construction are now being prepared through an inter-ministerial working group. To prepare Land Use Maps for urban areas, the Ministry of Land Management, Urban Planning and Construction is providing technical support to District/Khan, provincial and municipal authorities in order to collect and verify data on Urban and Provincial Land Use Planning from ten provinces /Municipality. The task of data collection in Stung Hao and Bovet Towns has been completed and work is nearing completion in three more areas - the towns of Kratie, Neak Loeung and Anlong Veng. In addition, a Strategic Development Plan for Phnom Penh city has been finalized and work is now underway in three other provinces (Sihanouk, Kep and Kompong Cham province).	In the process of developing master plan or land use maps of the city, district and commune, the government shall arrange more consultation with local communities as well as engage them in the formulating process of the master plan of the city, khan, and in drafting all legal and regulatory frameworks, then publicize all relevant information to guarantee transparency, clear division of task and fruitful impact on land use.
	111	RGC has been implementing a policy to distribute land to landless citizens through its <i>social land concessions</i> program. The National Strategic Development Plan (NSDP) 2006-2010 had set a target of providing land to 10,000 landless-families under this program. To reach this target, each Province/Municipality has been asked to make available land for at least 416 families. The Royal Government has identified 36,917 hectares of	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • So far, there are some cases of social land concession distribution which had been done without thoroughly examining land space at the ground. This lack of attention and concerted effort caused overlapping granting between land granted to some private companies through economic land concession and actual land already occupied by local people. The overlapping granting undeniably results in land conflict, force eviction and many cases, unfair compensation.

		<p>state-owned land in twelve provinces for distribution to 14,791 landless poor households under its social land concessions program. So far:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 4,700 hectares of land have been distributed to 783 households under LASED Kampong Cham. • 9,514 hectares of land have been distributed to 190 households in Kratie. • 129 hectares of de-mined land to 95 households in Uddor Meanchey. • 1,019 hectares of land to 317 families of disabled veterans in Taken Koh Sla commune of Chhouk district in Kampot province. • 2,074 hectares of land to 903 families of soldiers who served along the Thai-Cambodian border in Choam Khsan district in Preah Vihear province. • At the same time, under a plan initiated by the head of Government, 4,500 hectares of land has been reserved for 793 families to develop a new village named "Thomcheat" in the area of Preah Vihear temple to be developed with financial support from the Royal Government. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • So far, some social land concession had been largely distributed to the people but not done alongside with the provision of suitable even basic social and economic infrastructures such as road, school, information access, health care, market, clean water, electricity and link to outside economic areas. • Basing on the previous lesson learned, socioeconomic infrastructure should be done before moving people to live in the social land concession areas. <p>Comparing the number of the poor in the country and the abundance of land availability, the government still enables to distribute more land to the poor as well as smallholder farmers. There also should have a balance between economic and social land concession.</p>
	112	<p>Notwithstanding the progress made so far, many challenges remain that will require concerted action to enhance citizens' confidence in land management practices:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There is a need to promote the culture of land registration and to further strengthen the services delivery by the Cadastral System through a Single Window process that is transparent and accountable and delivers its services in a timely manner to build citizens confidence in the system. Accelerate the countrywide land systematic land registration system, in particular in the economically potential areas through establishment of a special operation agency. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Based on observation, economic land concession was granted over the maximum size permitted by the land law 2001, had no effective monitoring measurement, and clear penalty, for example: confiscating unused land. • Areas of granting economic land concession is generally identified on the map without examine on the actual area on the ground which sometimes overlapping on community's areas or some other private company's concession. • Before granting economic land concession, the adequate consultation should be conducted with the local communities because this can affect community livelihoods. • There are some cases that a number of economic land concessions were granted to a single individual which are

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Land management, land use and land distribution processes need to be made more transparent, equitable and effective. The management of state land needs to be strengthened using various tools, including land management planning for all levels to direct land development and monitoring, preventing Concentration of unused land in few hands, preventing clearance of state-owned lands, forestlands, and lands in National Strategic Development Plan Update 2009 – 2013 protected areas. Properly identifying lands to allocate for poor landless families, veterans, and for relocation of families displaced due to economic development projects of private companies, or through actions to recover state lands that were occupied illegally -- through RGC's social land concessions program; as well as taking more stringent enforcement measures against the concessionaires who do not properly comply with the terms and conditions of the agreements of economic land concessions. • Undertake a review of already granted large economic concessions by strengthening the control mechanism for contract implementation; verify the size of authorized lands in order to take back land that are not being used in accordance with contracts or exceed the limits under the 2001 land law and to remove from the concessions lands of 'protected areas' and lands already earlier held by people, which had been inadvertently included in concessions, and restore such areas back to 'protected areas' or to the people who were using them, as the case may be. • Strengthen the social and environmental impact assessment in a participatory and transparent manner in the areas considered to be land concessions. • Pursue and ensure registration of state land according 	<p>found to oppose the merit of the land law. Please re-check all these cases and manage coherent procedure and regulation to take back any unused or idle land.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Land speculation is going on without any effective policy response, so the powerful rich and rich acquire more and more land without the moral of paying tax. • So far, economic land concession was granted without conducting the environmental and social impact assessment and also without consultation with the local communities. • Please arrange public consultation basing on the environmental impact assessment study with local people and related stakeholders when the government plans to grant economic land concession.
--	---	--

	<p>to procedures stipulated in the Sub-decree on the Management of State Land and the Registration of Indigenous-People Community lands where these people are living in community.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Strictly implement the Guiding Circular on Illegal Occupancy of State Land in order to identify speculators and to take back illegally-occupied lands for social development and environment protection purposes. • Pursue the taxation of idle lands; consider terminating concessions that are not complying with existing laws and regulations; set up a clear and well-functioning system of land information and land price valuation; and the preparation of strategic development plan for provinces and municipalities in particular for the economically potential areas in order to manage their development and to prevent concentration of lands for speculation. • Pursue implementation of RGC's Guiding Circular on the Plan on Distribution of Social Land Concessions to 416 families in each province to reach the target of 10,000 families by 2010. • Speed up the process to grant collective land rights and titles to indigenous minorities (estimated to be 17 groups) and to restore to them land wrongfully bought from them by some unscrupulous individuals; 2 pilot projects in Rattanakiri and 1 in Mondolkiri are being started to register lands held by such minorities. • Provide land to the landless poor where-ever possible. • Through education and wide publicity, warn poor people from parting with their land, their main source of livelihood, to speculative land grabbers who pay a price seemingly high to the poor who may quickly use up this newly acquired "wealth" for consumption and 	
--	---	--

		<p>are often left without any source of livelihood.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Speed up land dispute resolution process, in particular, the disputes of multi-parties by establishing Land Conflicts Mobile Team with a status of a special operational agency to clear the backlog in the districts. 	
	400	<p>The Royal Government's land reform program is focused on measures to strengthen land management, land distribution and land use, to ensure the security of land ownership, to eradicate illegal land holding, and to prevent concentration of unused land in few hands. Land reform is also crucial for the increase and allocation of agricultural land within the framework of granting social land concessions to farmers in order to enhance agricultural productivity and diversification. Land registration has achieved satisfactory progress by completing systematic registration in 175 communes/ sangkats in 11 provinces and municipalities. More than one million land titles have been issued.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Suggested to amend the second phrase "Land reform is crucial for the increase and allocation of social land concessions and for family's agricultural farm by providing land title to people especially the farmers to enhance agricultural productivity and diversification." Explain in detail the word "Diversification" Suggest listing down the actual number of land plots/ land size which is going to be registered in each year.
	401	<p>During the Fourth Legislature, the Royal Government will continue implementing land reforms within the framework of the Land Law and the existing land policy by developing additional legal and regulatory framework such as the Law on Expropriation, the Law on Pre-emption and Land Development, the Law on Construction and Urbanization and the National Construction Standards.</p>	<p>Suggested conducting the adequate consultation and including the Civil Society's representatives in the process of drafting legal and regulatory frameworks.</p>
	402	<p>The Royal Government will review and take necessary measures to increase the efficiency in the management and utilization of state-owned unused land and take legal actions with regard to illegal holding of state-owned land by private individuals. The Royal Government will accelerate the completion of the inventory of the state-</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Suggested to explain the phrase " Single Window to ensure transparency" Suggested to identify clearly about the "Accord Priority", whom will be the accorded parties?

		<p>owned immoveable assets. It will further speed up the systematic land registration by establishing a Single Window to ensure transparency. It will accord priority to the land conflict-free areas and areas inhabited by indigenous communities in order to reduce land conflict, ensure security of land ownership and eliminate illegal land holding. The Royal Government will continue to resolve land conflicts by using legal mechanisms to ensure justice coupled with the out-of-court conflict settlement mechanism. The Royal Government attaches priority to granting land ownership rights to poor households and vulnerable groups for housing, farming and small businesses.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Suggested to adding sentence “ ---and eliminate illegal land holding. The Royal Government will take effective measurement to protect the indigenous' land by not granting the economic land concession in areas where the indigenous people settled. The Royal Government will continue to resolve land conflicts by using existing mechanisms in place such as (Cadastral Commission and National Authority for Land Dispute Resolution) to ensure adequate resolution and ensure justice coupled with the in-and-out-of-court mechanism. The Royal Government is speeding up and attaches priority for granting land ownership rights to poor households and vulnerable groups such as housing, farming and small businesses.
	403	<p>To ensure land use efficiency, the Royal Government will speed up the preparation of Land Use Map to enable orderly allocation of land for agriculture, industry, tourism, rural, urban, residential and reserved areas in order to prevent improper land use and land conversion. The Royal Government will review and regularly monitor the economic land concessions to ensure that they conform to the agreed upon priorities and to make them active as well as to avoid unproductive holding of land.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Suggest adding phrase in the first sentence “... in order to prevent improper land use and land conversion with participation from all relevant parties. The royal government”
	405	<p>To implement Royal Government's priority policies for the Fourth Legislature, the Ministry of Land Management and Construction will take actions to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Continue the registration of ownership and other rights on all immovable properties (state and private property), transferring rights on those property, preventing and solving land disputes to enhance the security of land tenure and ensure an efficiently 	<p>Suggested to add sentence and phrase in the first and second bullet points such as:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Speed up and continue the registration of ownership and other rights on all immovable properties----- this process should be in accordance with the principle of good governance, transparency, centralization and decentralization, gender equity to develop a culture of land registration and to improving the land registration system.

	<p>functioning land market.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Speed up the process of planning for all scales and levels of land management and mapping state land in all towns and districts complying with the principles of transparency, participation, accordance, and respect for the hierarchy of setting up plan, order and legal procedure to ensure the management, prevention and use of land and natural resources in transparency and efficacy by maintaining environmental sustainability and socio- economic development with equity within inhabited and rural areas; and avoiding the disputes on the use of land by formulating legal provisions on Land development, on Land Conversion, on Land Readjustment, on Construction and Resettlement on the basis of taking actions on Land Management Policy, Law on Land Management, Urbanization and Construction, Decentralization and De-concentration Policy and Good Governance, National Housing Policy, Resettlement Policy, Law on Land Tax, Law on Pre- Emption, Law on Expropriation, Disaffecting Law, Law on farming land...etc. • Conduct land distribution and use for private and public with transparency, equity, octal stability, food security, and the investment opportunity in accordance with land variety and natural advantage and in response to citizens' requirements in general; and in particular, the requirements of poor people, disabled veterans, families of sacrificed soldiers, and families of armed forces in duties in the front line of the battle field; through social land concession program, registration for collective lands of indigenous community resettlement program, review of economic land concession with the area disallowed by the land law and not following the agreements and/or without conducting social and environmental impact 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Speed up the process of planning for all scales and levels of land management and mapping state land in all towns and districts complying with the principles of transparency, participation from all relevant parties, accordance,---“ <p>Conduct land distribution and use for social land concession and public with transparency, equity, octal stability, food security, and the investment opportunity in accordance with land variety and natural advantage and in response to citizens' requirements in general; and in particular, the requirements of poor people, disabled veterans, families of sacrificed soldiers, and families of armed forces in duties in the front line of the battle field; through social land concession program. Developing of City's Master plan shall be conducted with the participation from community and civil society to guarantee the ownership in each area.</p>
--	---	--

		<p>assessment or without suitable utilization and development plans, through the implementation of Instruction 06 SNN focusing on illegal holding of state-owned lands to take back unused, purchased lands and state lands suffered from illegal deforestation.</p>	
	406	<p>In terms of specific activities, the Ministry of Land Management and Construction will:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Continue fastening the development of policy and legal frameworks related to the reinforcement of undertaking land law and other relevant legislation to land administration task, land management and construction and land distribution performance. The priority settings to be paid attention are as follows: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➢ Developing the cuacnt Interim Paper of Strategic framework for Land Policy to a Comprehensive Land Policy Paper, (White paper) ➢ Developing and strengthening law practice and regulatory framework such as Law on Expropriation, Law on Demarcation and Mapping, Law on Construction, Code of Urbanization, Law on Pre-emption, Disaffecting Law, Law on Farming Land, and other additional regulatory frameworks concerning Land transfer, Land consolidation, Land sub-division, Land valuation, Land market, Construction standards, as well as amendments of some articles within Laws and some legal norms relevant to land law, taxation law, law on land management, urbanization and construction pursuant to the nation's progress. ➢ Creating and enhancing the performance of 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Suggest adding sentence in the 3rd bullet point "...efficiency of State immovable properties management and have to disclose all related documents to the public regularly, timely and reliably manner in order to ensure transparency and accountability. • Suggest adding sentence in the fourth bullet point "...by insuring that the legal rights and benefits of female and indigenous group are properly protected." • In the 5th bullet point, what does Land Evaluation System base on? • Suggest adding phrase in the 5th bullet point "...in form of participatory approach from CSOs and related stakeholder, transparency..." • Please give an explanation on the word "up-to date land information" • Suggest adding phrase in the 6th bullet point "Strengthen the subsequent registration both in urban and rural area and precede the up-to date land information..." • Suggest changing phrase in the 7th bullet point "... (LIS) able to provide reliable information for people customers and to be a basis for designing national geographic database..." • Suggest specific date when geometric system will be established as mentioning in the 8th bullet point, for example: the geometric system is committed to be created in 2012. • Suggested adding phrase in the 10th bullet

	<p>National housing policy, Land management and Resettlement; legal framework and legal procedure suitable for managing land development in the urban and rural areas and land development for using in agricultural production and construction; and the proper limitation of building height in urban area.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Speed up the regulations development, technical norms for advancing construction: in particular, the construction of high buildings using modern technology is increasing gradually. Provide enough facilities for the skilful officers to be able to observe for the progress of technology and management effectively • Gradually establish a clear and complete inventory of State immovable properties (lands and buildings) in a unified database system in order to enhance the efficiency of State immovable properties management. • Conduct land registration throughout the country in a transparency and effective way for both State Land (public and private State lands), and individuals' private lands and Condominium. mainly, in the areas of economic potential and communal lands of indigenous communities in the areas of the communities really locate, in accordance with the existing legal procedures of both systematic and sporadic registration, to achieving by 32 percent in 2010 and by 38-39 percent in 2013 of total plots within 4 indigenous communities by insuring that the legal rights and benefits of female are properly protected. • Enhance the subsequent registration through a Single Window with a Land Valuation System created in form of participatory approach, 	<p>point "...unused land, cadastral definition, and compensation) by independent agencies and the creation of legal framework concerning the management of professional assessment on the price of immovable properties.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Suggested adding phrase in the 12th bullet point"- Precede both in and out court solving land dispute through..." • In the 16th bullet point shows that only a small number of families who will receive the social land concession until 2013 (only 10,000 families). We suggested that a number of the families who will be granted social land concession should increase to 25,000 families instead. • Suggested adding sentence in bullet points "...to social issue solution and national defense by creating mechanism to ensure transparency, accountability and equity to the poor, and demand for the attention to Social Land concession for poor people especially at rural area and develop basic infrastructure also. • Suggest editing the 17th bullet point as below: re-checking all ELCs which have been granted so far, especially those that were not complied by the article of land law, for example; the size of granting is larger than the defined size stated in the land law. Granting ELCs will be only done through legal framework, basing on in-depth study on environmental impact assessment and participatory consultation with all stakeholders. • Suggest adding one more bullet point as below: encourage people to increase agriculture production in order to improve farmer their livelihoods.
--	--	---

		<p>transparency, public accessibility, reliability, and coordination with Land Use Mapping, Registration and State Land Inventory, especially in urban and inhabited areas, forest and protected areas land demarcation for complying with the existing legal and regulatory frameworks, in particular with Sub decree on State Land Management.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Strengthen the subsequent registration and proceed the up-to date land information by upholding a Single Window practice for an increase of national budget with transparency and public confidence. • Produce Land Information System (LIS) able to provide reliable information for customers and to be basis for structuring national geographic database and for multipurpose of usage. • Create geometry system and land classification system according to land natural characteristic and geographical information system with uniformity throughout the country. • Keep preparing geodesy and altitude networks throughout the country and establish permanent GPS station. • Prepare participatory, transparent and formal recognized system for assessing land price on the basis of land natural advantage equality with the inclusion of all land surface immovable properties for reference in purchasing and sale, rental, investment, lending, taxation (annual tax on the transference, rental, profit, unused land, cadastral definition, and compensation), and the creation of legal framework concerning the management of professional assessment on the price of immovable property. 	
--	--	---	--

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Keep implementing the policy of disregarding tax on farming lands for household cultivation. At the same time, it is important to initiate the study of annual tax collection for unallowable property, except for household farming lands, in the purpose of preparing law concerning tax collection for land. • Proceed out court solving land dispute through the administrative and cadastral commissions of all levels (national, city/province, town/district and mobile group) and national authority for land dispute solution; particularly, for the case of multi party disputes. • Encourage and compile inventory list for state lands in reservation for current and future land distribution and use with transparency, equity and accountability. • Make planning system for land management including master plan or national, divisional and provincial plan and sub-national land use plan (commune and town/district) with the involvement of all skilful and relevant people by accomplishing a consensus in the compliance with the nature of land and requirement for economic and social development to be tool in strengthening land use and natural resources management and inspection with transparency, equity and environmental sustainability; and for the support of decentralization and de-concentration in land management. Meanwhile, it is necessary to encourage the process of making development plans for urban and inhabited areas, identification of used land area, limited high building areas, and disallowable area for construction, inspection of construction site with the inclusion, of legal 	
--	---	--

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • procedure of non-developed land management. • Establish and implement the strategy and framework of land distribution plan for middle and long term for land distribution and use targeting social and economic purpose in compliance with national, divisional, city/provincial, town/district, and communal plans with transparency and efficiency to avoid negative impact to society and environment, to prevent land purchase without using, to confiscate illegal grabbed state lands on the basis of reinforcing efficiency in performing the existing policy and legal framework; above all, instruction circular numbering 06 about state land unlawful grab as well as the strengthen of duty on unused lands. • Conduct land distribution for social concession purpose to 10,000 families in 2013 to contribute to social issue solution and national defense. • Precisely examine the performance of the existing economic concession agreements as well as economic land concession with the area disallowed by land law and new economic land concession to be granted, basing on sub-decree on economic land concession and permanent legal framework with thorough social and environmental impact assessment, and transparently participated by all related people; especially, at the local grassroots level. • Continue partnership between the owners of small farming land and plantation and other agricultural production corporation and between economic land concession and social land concession to create job opportunity and market for local people. 	
Page*	Para-	Original Text from the first draft NSDP Update 2009-	NGO Comment

	number**	2013	
	104	The Royal Government recognizes that land reform is vital to enhance social stability, the development of an efficient land market, environmental sustainability, and for increasing agricultural productivity through the issuance of land titles to the citizens; in particular, to farmers who are cultivating land that they occupy. Issuing land titles to citizens is vital for improving the management of land use, especially the management of state owned lands, to ensure security of land tenure in a transparent and equitable manner, and to further reduce poverty by enabling citizens to have access to financial markets by using their land titles as collateral. It was estimated in 2001 that there are 6-7 million parcels of land (plot) for which land titles have to be issued.	The statistic which has shown the land titles about 6-7 million parcels of land (plot) over country which issued in 2001 is not fairly equal to the statistic of people during the period. The land registration mechanism is still not functioned properly and this weakness can cause land registration less effective to achieve the expected number raised in the NSDP.
	106	Significant progress has been made in <i>issuing land titles</i> . So far, 1,664,297 land titles have been issued, of which 3/4 are rural lands and 1/4 are urban lands. Of these, 1,070,665 titles were issued through systematic land titling process whilst 593,645 titles were issued through sporadic titling. To-date the land titling process has, therefore, covered between 23 and 24 percent of total land plots (6-7 million) throughout the Kingdom. The targets set for the issuance of land titles in the Cambodian Millennium Development Goals (CMDGs) for the year 2010 is the registration of 32 percent of total land parcels (plots) – of which 24 percent are set for lands owned by farmers. The CMDGs targets for 2015 are registration of 65 percent of total land parcels (plots) – of which 48.75 percent are the land parcels (plots) owned by farmers. Of the total land titles issued so far, 70 percent are for common property of couples, 20 percent are for property owned by women, 5 percent are for personal property owned by men, and another 5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • So far, land registration is conducting more in the rural area than in the urban area (3/ 4 % in rural and 1/4% in urban) which most of the lands are agricultural farms that belong to farmers and in addition, does not have many conflicts, so the registration process run smoothly. <p>Suggested to speed up the land registration more in urban than rural area in the upcoming annual plan of the MLMUPC in order to reduce the land conflict and to enable people to use their land for production.</p>

		percent are for property owned by monasteries.	
	110	To further strengthen <i>land management</i> , the process of establishing policy framework and relevant regulatory frameworks such as land management policy, national housing policy, guidelines on legal procedures for resettlement, and law on land management, urbanization and construction are now being prepared through an inter-ministerial working group. To prepare Land Use Maps for urban areas, the Ministry of Land Management, Urban Planning and Construction is providing technical support to District/Khan, provincial and municipal authorities in order to collect and verify data on Urban and Provincial Land Use Planning from ten provinces /Municipality. The task of data collection in Stung Hao and Bovet Towns has been completed and work is nearing completion in three more areas - the towns of Kratie, Neak Loeung and Anlong Veng. In addition, a Strategic Development Plan for Phnom Penh city has been finalized and work is now underway in three other provinces (Sihanouk, Kep and Kompong Cham province).	In the process of making master plan or land use maps of city, district and commune, government shall conduct adequate consultation with local communities as well as including them in the process while preparing the master plan for the city, khan, and drafting all legal and regulatory frameworks in this sector then publicize all relevant information to guarantee transparency, and equity of land distribution and land use and management.
	111	RGC has been implementing a policy to distribute land to landless citizens through its <i>social land concessions</i> program. The National Strategic Development Plan (NSDP) 2006-2010 had set a target of providing land to 10,000 landless-families under this program. To reach this target, each Province/Municipality has been asked to make available land for at least 416 families. The Royal Government has identified 36,917 hectares of state-owned land in twelve provinces for distribution to 14,791 landless poor households under its social land concessions program. So far: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 4,700 hectares of land have been distributed to 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • So far, there are some cases of social land concession distribution which had been done without examining the ground which caused overlapping the area which already granted as economic land concession to some private companies or overlapping on the land occupied by the local people which made those people affected by force eviction or created land conflict in area. • So far, some cases of social land concession had been distributed to the people without building infrastructures and set up public services such as road, school, health care, toilet and well in advance

		<p>783 households under LASED Kampong Cham.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 9,514 hectares of land have been distributed to 190 households in Kratie. • 129 hectares of de-mined land to 95 households in Uddor Meanchey. • 1,019 hectares of land to 317 families of disabled veterans in Taken Koh Sla commune of Chhouk district in Kampot province. • 2,074 hectares of land to 903 families of soldiers who served along the Thai-Cambodian border in Choam Khsan district in Preah Vihear province. • At the same time, under a plan initiated by the head of Government, 4,500 hectares of land has been reserved for 793 families to develop a new village named "Thomcheat" in the area of Preah Vihear temple to be developed with financial support from the Royal Government. 	<p>for the people which causing impacts on their social welfare.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • For the next social land concession, please build basic infrastructure first before bring the people to live at the area. <p>Comparing the number of the poor in the country the distributing of social land concession is still limited compare to the total number of poor people in the country.</p>
	112	<p>Notwithstanding the progress made so far, many challenges remain that will require concerted action to enhance citizens' confidence in land management practices:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There is a need to promote the culture of land registration and to further strengthen the services delivery by the Cadastral System through a Single Window process that is transparent and accountable and delivers its services in a timely manner to build citizens confidence in the system. Accelerate the countrywide land systematic land registration system, in particular in the economically potential areas through establishment of a special operation agency. • Land management, land use and land distribution processes need to be made more transparent, equitable and effective. The 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Based on observation, economic land concession are granted over the maximum size in which allowing by the land law, have no effective monitoring measurement, and have no taking back measurement . • Areas of granting economic land concession is generally identified on the map without examine on the actual area on the ground which sometime overlapping on community's area or some other private company's concession. • Before granting economic land concession the adequate consultation should be conducting with the local communities because this can affected community's daily livelihood. • There are some cases of a number of economic land concession were granted to a single individual which contrasting to the merit of the law. Please re-check with this case and make a take back the overlap land. • Land speculation is going on without any preventing action plan.

	<p>management of state land needs to be strengthened using various tools, including land management planning for all levels to direct land development and monitoring, preventing Concentration of unused land in few hands, preventing clearance of state-owned lands, forestlands, and lands in National Strategic Development Plan Update 2009 – 2013 protected areas. Properly identifying lands to allocate for poor landless families, veterans, and for relocation of families displaced due to economic development projects of private companies, or through actions to recover state lands that were occupied illegally -- through RGC's social land concessions program; as well as taking more stringent enforcement measures against the concessionaires who do not properly comply with the terms and conditions of the agreements of economic land concessions.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Undertake a review of already granted large economic concessions by strengthening the control mechanism for contract implementation; verify the size of authorized lands in order to take back land that are not being used in accordance with contracts or exceed the limits under the 2001 land law and to remove from the concessions lands of 'protected areas' and lands already earlier held by people, which had been inadvertently included in concessions, and restore such areas back to 'protected areas' or to the people who were using them, as the case may be. • Strengthen the social and environmental impact assessment in a participatory and transparent manner in the areas considered to be land 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • So far, economic land concession was granted without conducting the environmental and social impact assessment and also without consultation with the local communities. • Please open for public consultation with local people, where the economic land concession make, and related stakeholder and make detail study in environmental impact assessment before grand this ELC.
--	---	---

	<p>concessions.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Pursue and ensure registration of state land according to procedures stipulated in the Sub-decree on the Management of State Land and the Registration of Indigenous-People Community lands where these people are living in community. • Strictly implement the Guiding Circular on Illegal Occupancy of State Land in order to identify speculators and to take back illegally-occupied lands for social development and environment protection purposes. • Pursue the taxation of idle lands; consider terminating concessions that are not complying with existing laws and regulations; set up a clear and well-functioning system of land information and land price valuation; and the preparation of strategic development plan for provinces and municipalities in particular for the economically potential areas in order to manage their development and to prevent concentration of lands for speculation. • Pursue implementation of RGC's Guiding Circular on the Plan on Distribution of Social Land Concessions to 416 families in each province to reach the target of 10,000 families by 2010. • Speed up the process to grant collective land rights and titles to indigenous minorities (estimated to be 17 groups) and to restore to them land wrongfully bought from them by some unscrupulous individuals; 2 pilot projects in Rattanakiri and 1 in Mondolkiri are being started to register lands held by such minorities. • Provide land to the landless poor where-ever 	
--	---	--

		<p>possible.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Through education and wide publicity, warn poor people from parting with their land, their main source of livelihood, to speculative land grabbers who pay a price seemingly high to the poor who may quickly use up this newly acquired "wealth" for consumption and are often left without any source of livelihood. • Speed up land dispute resolution process, in particular, the disputes of multi-parties by establishing Land Conflicts Mobile Team with a status of a special operational agency to clear the backlog in the districts. 	
	400	<p>The Royal Government's land reform program is focused on measures to strengthen land management, land distribution and land use, to ensure the security of land ownership, to eradicate illegal land holding, and to prevent concentration of unused land in few hands. Land reform is also crucial for the increase and allocation of agricultural land within the framework of granting social land concessions to farmers in order to enhance agricultural productivity and diversification. Land registration has achieved satisfactory progress by completing systematic registration in 175 communes/ sangkats in 11 provinces and municipalities. More than one million land titles have been issued.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Suggested to amend the second phrase "Land reform is crucial for the increase and allocation of social land concessions and for family's agricultural farm by providing land title to people especially the farmers to enhance agricultural productivity and diversification." • Explain in detail the word "Diversification" • Suggested to list down the actual number of pieces of land which going to be registered in each year.
	401	<p>During the Fourth Legislature, the Royal Government will continue implementing land reforms within the framework of the Land Law and the existing land policy by developing additional legal and regulatory framework such as the Law on Expropriation, the Law on Pre-emption and Land Development, the Law on Construction and Urbanization and the National</p>	<p>Suggested to conducting the adequate consultation and including the Civil Society's representatives in the process of draft those legal and regulatory frameworks.</p>

		Construction Standards.	
	402	The Royal Government will review and take necessary measures to increase the efficiency in the management and utilization of state-owned unused land and take legal actions with regard to illegal holding of state-owned land by private individuals. The Royal Government will accelerate the completion of the inventory of the state-owned immovable assets. It will further speed up the systematic land registration by establishing a Single Window to ensure transparency. It will accord priority to the land conflict-free areas and areas inhabited by indigenous communities in order to reduce land conflict, ensure security of land ownership and eliminate illegal land holding. The Royal Government will continue to resolve land conflicts by using legal mechanisms to ensure justice coupled with the out-of-court conflict settlement mechanism. The Royal Government attaches priority to granting land ownership rights to poor households and vulnerable groups for housing, farming and small businesses.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Suggested to explain the phrase “Single Window to ensure transparency” • Suggested to identify clearly about the “Accord Priority”, whom will be the accorded parties? • Suggested to adding sentence “---and eliminate illegal land holding. The Royal Government will take effective measurement to protect the indigenous’ land by not granting the economic land concession in area where the indigenous people settled. The Royal Government will continue to resolve land conflicts by using existing mechanisms such as (Cadastral Commission and National Authority for Land Dispute Resolution) to ensure adequate resolution and ensure justice coupled within the in-and-out-of-court mechanism. The Royal Government is speeding up and attaches priority to granting land ownership rights to poor households and vulnerable groups for housing, farming and small businesses.
	403	To ensure land use efficiency, the Royal Government will speed up the preparation of Land Use Map to enable orderly allocation of land for agriculture, industry, tourism, rural, urban, residential and reserved areas in order to prevent improper land use and land conversion. The Royal Government will review and regularly monitor the economic land concessions to ensure that they conform to the agreed upon priorities and to make them active as well as to avoid unproductive holding of land.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Suggested to add phrase in the first sentence “... in order to prevent improper land use and land conversion with participation from all relevant parties. The royal government”
	405	To implement Royal Government’s priority policies for the Fourth Legislature, the Ministry of Land Management and Construction will take actions to:	<p>Suggested to add sentence and phrase in the first and second bullet points such as</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Speed up and continue the registration of ownership

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Continue the registration of ownership and other rights on all immovable properties (state and private property), transferring rights on those property, preventing and solving land disputes to enhance the security of land tenure and ensure an efficiently functioning land market. • Speed up the process of planning for all scales and levels of land management and mapping state land in all towns and districts complying with the principles of transparency, participation, accordance, and respect for the hierarchy of setting up plan, order and legal procedure to ensure the management, prevention and use of land and natural resources in transparency and efficacy by maintaining environmental sustainability and socio- economic development with equity within inhabited and rural areas; and avoiding the disputes on the use of land by formulating legal provisions on Land development, on Land Conversion, on Land Readjustment, on Construction and Resettlement on the basis of taking actions on Land Management Policy, Law on Land Management, Urbanization and Construction, Decentralization and De-concentration Policy and Good Governance, National Housing Policy, Resettlement Policy, Law on Land Tax, Law on Pre- Emption, Law on Expropriation, Disaffecting Law, Law on farming land...etc. • Conduct land distribution and use for private and public with transparency, equity, octal stability, food security, and the investment opportunity in accordance with land variety and natural advantage and in response to citizens' requirements in general; and in particular, the requirements of poor people, disabled veterans, families of sacrificed soldiers, and families of armed forces in duties in the front line of the battle field; through social land concession program. Developing of City's Master plan shall be conducted with the participation from community and civil society to guarantee the ownership in each area.
--	--

		<p>requirements of poor people, disabled veterans, families of sacrificed soldiers, and families of armed forces in duties in the front line of the battle field; through social land concession program, registration for collective lands of indigenous community resettlement program, review of economic land concession with the area disallowed by the land law and not following the agreements and/or without conducting social and environmental impact assessment or without suitable utilization and development plans, through the implementation of Instruction 06 SNN focusing on illegal holding of state-owned lands to take back unused, purchased lands and state lands suffered from illegal deforestation.</p>	
	406	<p>In terms of specific activities, the Ministry of Land Management and Construction will:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Continue fastening the development of policy and legal frameworks related to the reinforcement of undertaking land law and other relevant legislation to land administration task, land management and construction and land distribution performance. The priority settings to be paid attention are as follows: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➢ Developing the cuacnt Interim Paper of Strategic framework for Land Policy to a Comprehensive Land Policy Paper, (White paper) ➢ Developing and strengthening law practice and regulatory framework such as Law on Expropriation, Law on Demarcation and Mapping, Law on Construction, Code of Urbanization, Law on Pre-emption, Disaffecting Law, Law on Farming Land, and 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Suggested to add sentence in the third bullet points "...efficiency of State immovable properties management and have to disclose all related document in public in order to shown the transparency and accountability. • Suggested to add sentence in the forth bullet points "...by insuring that the legal rights and benefits of female and indigenous group are properly protected." • In the fifth bullet point, what does Land Evaluation System make base on? • Suggested to add phrase in fifth bullet point "...in form of participatory approach from CSOs and related stakeholder, transparency..." • Please give an explanation word up-to date land information • Suggested to add phrase in six bullet point "Strengthen the subsequent registration both in urban and rural area and proceed the up-to date land information..."

		<p>other additional regulatory frameworks concerning Land transfer, Land consolidation, Land sub-division, Land valuation, Land market, Construction standards, as well as amendments of some articles within Laws and some legal norms relevant to land law, taxation law, law on land management, urbanization and construction pursuant to the nation's progress.</p> <p>➢ Creating and enhancing the performance of National housing policy, Land management and Resettlement; legal framework and legal procedure suitable for managing land development in the urban and rural areas and land development for using in agricultural production and construction; and the proper limitation of building height in urban area.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Speed up the regulations development, technical norms for advancing construction: in particular, the construction of high buildings using modern technology is increasing gradually. Provide enough facilities for the skilful officers to be able to observe for the progress of technology and management effectively • Gradually establish a clear and complete inventory of State immovable properties (lands and buildings) in a unified database system in order to enhance the efficiency of State immovable properties management. • Conduct land registration throughout the country in a transparency and effective way for both State Land (public and private State lands), and individuals' private lands and Condominium. mainly, in the areas of economic potential and communal lands of indigenous communities in the 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Suggested to change phrase in seven bullet point "... (LIS) able to provide reliable information for people customers and to be basis for structuring national geographic database..." • Suggested to make clear of the year which will created geometry system in the bullet points eight for example the geometry system will create on 2012. • Suggested to add phrase in ten bullet point "...unused land, cadastral definition, and compensation) by independent agency and the creation of legal framework concerning the management of professional assessment on the price of immovable property. • Suggested to add phrase in twelfth bullet points "Proceed both in and out court solving land dispute through..." • In the sixteen bullet points shown a little number of families who will receive the social land concession until 2013 (only 10,000 families) we suggested that among of families should increase to 25,000 families. • Suggested to add sentence in sixteen bullet points "...to social issue solution and national defense by created mechanism to ensure transparency accountability and equity to the poor people and attention to the Social Land concession for poor people especially at rural area and develop basic infrastructure also. • Suggested to edit whole seventeen bullet point as below: re-checking all of ELC which have been provided that have over large size which state in the Land law and not implemented thought the contract and all new ELC which plan to grant base on the sub-degree on ELC with clear legal framework include detail and transparency of environmental and social impact assessment with participatory approach from
--	--	---	---

	<p>areas of the communities really locate, in accordance with the existing legal procedures of both systematic and sporadic registration, to achieving by 32 percent in 2010 and by 38-39 percent in 2013 of total plots within 4 indigenous communities by insuring that the legal rights and benefits of female are properly protected.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Enhance the subsequent registration through a Single Window with a Land Valuation System created in form of participatory approach, transparency, public accessibility, reliability, and coordination with to Land Use Mapping, Registration and State Land Inventory, especially in urban and inhabited areas, forest and protected areas land demarcation for in complying with the existing legal and regulatory frameworks, in particular with Sub decree on State Land Management. • Strengthen the subsequent registration and proceed the up-to date land information by upholding a Single Window practice for an increase of national budget with transparency and public confidence. • Produce Land Information System (LIS) able to provide reliable information for customers and to be basis for structuring national geographic database and for multipurpose of usage. • Create geometry system and land classification system according to land natural characteristic and geographical information system with uniformity throughout the country. • Keep preparing geodesy and altitude networks throughout the country and establish permanent GPS station. • Prepare participatory, transparent and formal 	<p>related stakeholder especial people in place. If found that there are ELC which over large size than state in the Land law, please cut it and return back to the people and delete all ELC contract which will strongly impact to environment and social well-being.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Suggested to add one more bullet point as below: encourage people to develop agriculture produce in order to make better of daily livelihood.
--	--	---

		<p>recognized system for assessing land price on the basis of land natural advantage equality with the inclusion of all land surface immovable properties for reference in purchasing and sale, rental, investment, lending, taxation (annual tax on the transference, rental, profit, unused land, cadastral definition, and compensation), and the creation of legal framework concerning the management of professional assessment on the price of immovable property.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Keep implementing the policy of disregarding tax on farming lands for household cultivation. At the same time, it is important to initiate the study of annual tax collection for immoveable property, except for household farming lands, in the purpose of preparing law concerning tax collection for land. • Proceed out court solving land dispute through the administrative and cadastral commissions of all levels (national, city/province, town/district and mobile group) and national authority for land dispute solution; particularly, for the case of multi party disputes. • Encourage and compile inventory list for state lands in reservation for current and future land distribution and use with transparency, equity and accountability. • Make planning system for land management including master plan or national, divisional and provincial plan and sub-national land use plan (commune and town/district) with the involvement of all skilful and relevant people by accomplishing a consensus in the compliance with the nature of land and requirement for economic and social development to be tool in strengthening land use 	
--	--	--	--

	<p>and natural resources management and inspection with transparency, equity and environmental sustainability; and for the support of decentralization and de-concentration in land management. Meanwhile, it is necessary to encourage the process of making development plans for urban and inhabited areas, identification of used land area, limited high building areas, and disallowable area for construction, inspection of construction site with the inclusion, of legal procedure of non-developed land management.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Establish and implement the strategy and framework of land distribution plan for middle and long term for land distribution and use targeting social and economic purpose in compliance with national, divisional, city/provincial, town/district, and communal plans with transparency and efficiency to avoid negative impact to society and environment, to prevent land purchase without using, to confiscate illegal grabbed state lands on the basis of reinforcing efficiency in performing the existing policy and legal framework; above all, instruction circular numbering 06 about state land unlawful grab as well as the strengthen of duty on unused lands. • Conduct land distribution for social concession purpose to 10,000 families in 2013 to contribute to social issue solution and national defense. • Precisely examine the performance of the existing economic concession agreements as well as economic land concession with the area disallowed by land law and new economic land concession to be granted, basing on sub-decree on economic land concession and permanent legal framework with thorough social and 	
--	---	--

		<p>environmental impact assessment, and transparently participated by all related people; especially, at the local grassroots level.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Continue partnership between the owners of small farming land and plantation and other agricultural production corporation and between economic land concession and social land concession to create job opportunity and market for local people. 	
--	--	--	--

* The page number refers to the page-number of the first draft NSDP Update 2009-2013.

** The para-number refers to the paragraph-number of the first draft NSDP Update 2009-2013.

Contact Information

For more information on the issues raised in this sectoral comments, please contact:

The NGO Forum on Cambodia

Mr. Pen Raingsey, Land and Livelihood Programme Manager

Tel: 023 214 429

Fax: 023 994 063

Email: raingsey@ngoforum.org.kh

2. Forestry Reform

On behalf of the Forest Livelihoods and Plantation Network (FLPN) which comprised of 34 NGOs who are working in Forestry Sector in Cambodia, we observed that there are two big issues in Cambodia:

1. Economic Land Concession: Currently the RGC have used the mechanism to grant many ELCs in the country for economic development to reduce poverty. But the system used by the government has serious negative consequences for communities and these concessions provide few benefits for most Cambodians. Moreover, through our experience, we found that the Economic and Social Impact Assessment for most of the ELCs are not yet have properly consultation with communities who live near or in the area of those ELCs. We learnt that the Economic Land Concession (ELCs) strongly contribute to forestry damage in Cambodia.
2. Another issue is that lack of a clear national land-use plan which includes forests, all types of concessions, protected areas, community managed resources, state public land etc. and clear boundary demarcation for all of these. At the moment there is continual boundary conflict between competing claims for the same piece of land as there is a lack of coordination between the various government ministries involved.

Page*	Para-number**	Original Text from the first draft NSDP Update 2009-2013	NGO Comment
34 and 35	116	The implementation of the Law on Forestry and regulations along with good collaboration between all concerned institutions, forest resources are now more strictly managed, resulting in increased prevention and suppression on illegal forest land grabbing. In 2008, the Forestry Administration allocated 9 logging coups outside forest concession areas to meet local wood consumption amounting to about 261,270 m3. Reforestation/tree plantings, community's forestry establishment, forest boundary demarcation, and wildlife research and conservation were actively carried out as planned. However, illegal forest land clearing and land grabbing still exist. The Ministry of Interior plays an important role in issuing instructions to all level of local authorities to strengthen statistics, movement and resettlement of new incomers, and not to allocate forest areas for other purposes. The implementation of sub-decree on rules on the use of state forest lands for forest plantation will contribute towards achieving Cambodian Millennium Development Goals that set a target of 60 percent forest	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• We would like to request the government to publicly disclose the forest cutting plan or forest management plan for the whole Cambodia.• We would like to suggest the government to state agreement of percentage of forest to be retained only for natural forest not include the industrial plantations. We think that plantation is not forest. CMDG indicators need to be reformulated to state agreements on the % of natural forest to be retained. It can be less than 60% but for natural forest only. Natural forest is essential to the environmental stability of Cambodia. As most Cambodians depend on natural resources, instability in the environment will lead to great negative impacts of all Cambodians.

		cover in 2015.	
35	117	<p>The Forestry Administration faces many challenges in carrying its tasks. These include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lack of human resources and incentive for staff working in remote areas. • Lack of budget for forest management and conservation. • Lack of offices and facilities for working. • Threats from powerful man. • Illegal people usually change mean of transportation of illegal timber and destroying forest. • Forest demarcation facing difficulties with encroachers and destruction of marking poles. 	<p>There is another challenges that FA have faced, there was some government authorities have involved in illegal forest logging in Cambodia which this is the most critical challenge that lead to unsuccessful sustainable forest management in Cambodia.</p>
124 and 125	416, 417, 418 and 419	<i>Policy Priorities for the Fourth Legislature</i>	We would like to request the government to state about the willingness to implement the National Forest Programme in NSDP update 2009-2013.
125	420	<p>The implement the RGC's priority policies for the Fourth Legislature, the Forestry Administration will take actions to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Continue to monitor and evaluate the effectiveness and efficiency of this program in terms of the improvement of livelihoods of the rural people, the sustainability of forest resources, and the expansion of forest communities. Moreover, the Royal Government • Encourages the private sector to establish commercial forest plantations in degraded forest land based on 	<p>We would like to suggest the government to clearly and independently review of the effectiveness of community forestry in the current situation. Some community forestry are difficult to implement their own activities because the nearby economic land concession. The main problem is that the actual practice of ELCs and mining concessions are inappropriate and mostly break the law. Under the conditions, the land that is not covered by community forestry is often destroyed or taken as land concessions. Community forestry is ineffective under these conditions or under the conditions where only small areas of disparate areas are accepted as community forestry.</p> <p>We would like to request the government to clearly define "<u>Commercial Forest Plantation</u>". Does the "<u>Commercial Forest Plantation</u>" refer to plantation</p>

	<p>agreed technical standards.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Continue to monitor forest concessions to ensure that they comply with international standards by seeking external technical and financial assistance and by active and appropriate participation of civil society in monitoring. 	<p>such as Economic Land Concession?</p> <p>In the paragraph 416 stated that the government already postpone the Forest Concession, but in the paragraph 418 stated that the government will continue to monitor forest concessions. So, does it mean that the government reactivates for the forest concession? How do the civil society organization involve in the process of forest concession monitoring? How many CSOs will the government selected for this process?</p>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Continue to strictly enforce the Law on Forestry and take serious measures against forestry crimes, and will continue educate people to be aware of obligations to protect forests and stop illegal forest encroachments. 	<p>We would like to suggest the government to check and solve the Community complaints related to forestry that have been lodged with government must be addressed and legally resolved as a matter of urgency. This is essential to the credibility of any forest and land management plans in Cambodia.</p>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Enhance management efficiency of the reserved forests and ensure their appropriate protection and development, including eco-tourism, for employment generation and additional income for the people. Moreover, attention will be given to the management of the protected areas. The Royal Government will mobilize resources, support, and financing to participate in global efforts to address challenges of climate change. 	<p>We would like to suggest the government to have clear plan for the expansion of forest conservation for carbon retention and sequestration in all provinces of Cambodia and to carefully view the Reduced Emissions from Deforestation and Degradation (REDD).</p>

* The page number refers to the page-number of the first draft NSDP Update 2009-2013 where you would like your comments to be incorporated.

** The para-number refers to the paragraph-number of the first draft NSDP Update 2009-2013 where you would like your comments to be incorporated.

Contact Information

For more information on the issues raised in this sectoral comments, please contact:

The NGO Forum on Cambodia
Mr. Pen Raingsey, Land and Livelihood Programme Manager
Tel: +855 23 214 429 Ext N° 109
Fax: +855 994 063
Email: raingsey@ngoforum.org.kh
Website: www.ngoforum.org.kh

3. Agriculture sector

The page number and paragraph numbers in the table below refer to the first draft NSDP 2009-2013, which is the reference document to be commented on.

Page*	Para-Number**	Suggestions/Comments for NSDP update 2009-2013
Foreword		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Poverty reduction and growth statistics by urban/rural/province breakdowns needed (note this is done in the country statistics and poverty indicator charts) • Results in rural poverty reduction through increased productivity will be achieved through investments in supporting sectors as well as ensuring that efforts at productivity enhancement emphasize environmental sustainability, participatory design and gender equity.
29	96	<p>Program # III: "Strengthen institution, legal framework and human resources development." Special attention and priority should be given towards the development of human resources in rural areas. A new program should also be considered and added to MAFF's objectives, which would focus on improving and strengthening agricultural research and extension systems.</p>
29	99	<p>For the improvement, law on agricultural pesticide management and agricultural land.</p> <p>The draft pesticide law should be released to the public, along with a series of public consultations and priority should be given towards the finalization of the law.</p> <p>MAFF should give opportunities to stakeholder involving during process, consultation and implementation.</p>
30	100	<p>Another challenge that the RGC should seek to address is the widespread usage of illegal chemical pesticides, which are often imported illegally from Vietnam and Thailand. The government should seek to reduce the usage of illegal chemical pesticides by ensuring all pesticides have proper labeling, farmers are educated on the risks involved with illegal pesticide use and by controlling borders and the importation of pesticides into the country. The RGC in return should encourage the use of sustainable organic pesticides and fertilizers. Another key challenge that remains is groundwater contamination and topsoil depletion from the usage of illegal pesticides and wrong fertilizer.</p>
43	152	<p>The RCG should develop an irrigation infrastructure master plan that is based on the prioritization of drought areas and based on the need of family farms. The government should encourage small-scale irrigation systems that are based on reduced water-volume irrigation technologies, in order to help ensure the water sustainability in the country.</p>
116	393	<p>As one of the main goals of the RGC's enhancement of the agriculture sector is to accelerate poverty reduction, we encourage the government to encourage sustainable agricultural practices and improving long-term food security for Cambodia, which encourages diverse and decentralized systems of family farms rather than corporate agro-industries.</p>

117	398	<p>3 activities that suggested into the Ministry of Agriculture Forestry and Fishery strategies there are:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Support and strengthen farmers agriculture inputs provider association (seed prevention, organic manure, post harvest) 2. Support and strengthen farmer's cooperative on credit service and rice mill and storage. 3. Strengthen rural youth capacity to become a agriculture entrepreneur
118	398	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In number VI, should be change the word of new technology to innovation (skill, approach, process) for focused within word to introduce chemical inputs and GMOs. • Domestic and Foreign investor should consider to the environmental protection. • Should create the mechanism to implementation during the climate change and how to adapt and mitigate its impacts in the agricultural sector, such as seeking sustainable agricultural practices and encouraging drought-tolerant crop species. The budget and grant for climate change adaptation should be prioritized for building irrigation system.

Contact Information:

For more information on the issues raised in this sectoral comments, please contact:

NGO Forum on Cambodia

Mrs. Men Vannavy

Pesticide Reduction and Sustainable Agriculture

Tel: (855)-12 48 33 64

Email: vannavy@ngoforum.org.kh

Website: www.ngoforum.org.kh

CEDAC

Mr. Sim Samoeun

Senior Program Director

Tel: (855)- 16 61 89 76

Email:simsim@online.com.kh

Website: www.cedac.org.kh

4. Fisheries

Page*	Para-number**	Original Text from the first draft NSDP Update 2009-2013	NGO Comment
vi			Fisheries stats are not harmonized with data from the SPF
29	95	Fisheries reform: sustainable access	What does the RGC mean by "sustainable access" for whom? What mechanisms are proposed for assuring this?
	96	Program #iv: Management of Sustainable Fishery Resources	Needs to be clear on what definition of <i>sustainable</i> is being used; <i>resilient</i> is perhaps better as it deals with the necessity of coping with change, especially when dealing with fisheries and Climate Change, how will Cambodian fisheries and fisher respond to CC?
34	114	650,000 T	471,000 as stated in the FiA 10 year SPF
	114	468 community fisheries	Change to 469 as in SPF
	114	433 Inland	Change to 434 as in SPF
34	115		<p>There needs to be a more cross-sectoral inclusion of the impacts of Climate Change including a detailed outlining of the strategies that the RGC is planning in order to deal with the impacts especially on fishing livelihoods in the Tonle sap, Mekong River and potential impacts on coastal fishing communities from sea level rise, saltwater intrusion; Lack of effective enforcement, lack of empowered community fisheries to stop illegal fishing</p> <p>There needs clear recognition by both the RGC and Provincial Cantonement counterparts on the profound alterations to Mekong Fisheries from hydropower development in both tributary dams and from proposed mainstream hydro developments. There is no mentioned on how the RGC plans to deal with these possible impacts to millions of fisher livelihoods.</p>
35	118		Should include a specific mention for the conservation and management of aquatic biodiversity and the importance of fisheries

			and aquatic products to health and well being of millions of Cambodians and how this is impacted by the multiple and cross-scale impacts of Climate Change and other landscape scale alterations
	409	509 fishing communities	<p>Does not correspond to previous numbers or with the SPF stats. (pg. 34 p. 114); how will the RGC develop and promote conservation/preservation of fish stocks and at the same time develop fishing livelihoods and new markets; this is very difficult task, especially with poor state capacity</p> <p>There is a need to develop the marketing/transport infrastructure in order to better bring quality fish products to both domestic and export markets</p> <p>There needs to be full re-evaluation of the fishing lot scale and its impacts on the poverty of Tonle Sap fishing communities; the lot system should be made fully transparent and leasee made fully accountable for maintaining AND improving ecosystem and fish stock health; portions of the revenues from fishing lots should be targeted for Fisheries Administration budget</p>
	411		
	412		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There needs to be a full social and economic evaluation of "eco-tourism" in Cambodia. There is no guarantee that "if you "build it they will come", areas such as Kratie/Sambour may be already overdeveloped with low #'s of tourists recorded. Ecotourism, a bottom up initiative must be guided by sound economic planning with consideration for potential positive and negative impacts on fisher livelihoods. • Aquaculture development capacity is poor in Cambodia, The FiA must develop linkages with Asian regional organizations such as SeafDec, NACA, AIT and others to develop the sustainable aquaculture capacity; Proper and well implemented broodstock (genetics) programs for aquaculture will reduce impacts of aquaculture on wild stocks; Cambodia should take creative steps to develop sustainable aquaculture such as rice-fish
	413		

			<p>systems, Integrated agri-aquaculture systems, Culture-based fisheries and have a well supported aquaculture and marketing unit in FiA with close links to private sector investore, so FiA should support and facilitate private sector aquaculture investment while at the same time developing the capacity to integrate aquaculture into the Community fisheries program.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • These are all very lofty goals which will require strong financial and legislative support and powers given to the FiA to implement its 10 yr. SPF. • All <i>actions</i> of implementation of fisheries development, management or conservation should be harmonized 1) with the 10 year SPF and 2) cross-sectoral with all relevant ministries and line agencies (LAs) including a full recognition of the potential impacts of climate change on the hydro-ecology of the fisheries of Cambodia and the resulting potential impacts on the rural poor who directly depend on fish and other aquatic resources for food and income. • There is no clear strategic statement on how the RGC will maintain a sustainable fishery for the benefits of the poor fishers; those families and communities most vulnerable, most dependent on fisheries resources for their existence • There is a need for the clear definition of fishers' rights in terms of access and benefits sharing from Cambodian waters including Fishing Lots in the Tonle / Bassac system. • There are no clear directions on how FiA intends to improve the role of women in marketing or increase their involvement in the Community Fisheries Program; space should be provided by FiA for more participation by women in both the Community Fishery and in the FiA itself including future management and research positions.
124	414	415	

* The page number refers to the page-number of the first draft NSDP Update 2009-2013.

** The para-number refers to the paragraph-number of the first draft NSDP Update 2009-2013.

Contact Information:

For more information on the issues raised in this sectoral comments, please contact:

Fisheries Action Coalition Team (FACT)

Mr. Ron Jones, Technical Advisor

Email: jonesr@fact.org.kh

5. Mining and its Environmental Impact

Page*	Para_Number**	Suggestions/comments for the NSDP Update
35	120	<p>Paragraph 120:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We kindly suggest that: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➢ In addition to other ministries and other concerned parties, the EIA Department of MOE also make an official effort to collaborate with NGOs and private citizens who wish to participate in the environmental planning process. This could entail the creation of a platform to solicit comments and input from communities and representatives of NGOs such as the Extractive Industry Social and Environmental Impact (EISEI) network who can share their observations and evidence on environmental impacts associated with projects under review by the MOE. Such a mechanism would be cost effective and would contribute to increased public participation and linkages between the state and its citizens.
36	123	<p>Paragraph 123:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We kindly suggest that: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➢ The MOE cooperate with MIME, MWRM and MAFF to mandate water quality testing in areas potentially affected by the expansion of all industries, including construction, extractive, hydropower and manufacturing. This cooperation would lead to increased communication between ministries and could prevent serious impacts to biodiversity, fisheries, agriculture and drinking water. ➢ The MOE establish and promulgate comprehensive minimum standards and parameters for water quality testing. These parameters could include heavy metals, industrial solvents, chemical fertilizers, dissolved oxygen, biological oxygen demand, etc.
41-42	151	<p>Paragraph 151, last bullet point:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We kindly suggest that:

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ All master plans on water resources management should be made publically available at a reasonable cost by MWRM. ➤ Rivers and watersheds (e.g. Srepok, Sekong, Voeun Sai) likely to be affected by extractive and hydropower industries in Ratanakiri, Mondulkiri and Stung Treng provinces should be studied and the results made publically available at a reasonable cost.
44	158	<p>Paragraph 158: Offshore oil and gas fields are common asset of all Cambodians, now and in the future...</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We kindly suggest that: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ The RGC will develop and implement a national policy for social and environmental responsibility in the extractive industries sector. ➤ The RGC will establish an independent public agency (by inter-ministries: MIME, MOE and Ministry of Health) with the mandate, resources and expertise to continuously, and comprehensively, oversee all aspects of the award of rights including the monitoring of health and socio-cultural impacts. Additionally, monitors under the supervision of Protected Area/Forestry (PA/F) authorities should monitor all exploration activities within PA/F. ➤ All responsible government agencies enforce a moratorium on the granting of exploration and extraction licenses in indigenous areas until indigenous communal land titling is completed. ➤ All responsible government agencies enforce a moratorium on the granting of exploration and extraction licenses in forested and biologically sensitive areas until demarcated boundaries are reviewed and drawn to protect these valuable remnants of Cambodia's original ecosystems. ➤ The RGC will develop in-country human resources and human resource development plan on extractive industries. This could ensure the development of adequate human resource for the EI sector. ➤ The development of the extractive industry (including oil, gas and mineral exploration) in Cambodia is documented but public dissemination is non-existent. Information on concessions will be made available on the responsible ministry's websites, including contracts, agreements, policy and legislation. Additionally, the RGC will develop policies and legislation outlining specific requirements and procedures for public consultation. ➤ The RGC will develop provisions which will enable civil society groups and the wider public to have full access to information relating to the extractive industries sector. For instance, disclosure information on the concession, contracts granted to mining companies, payments and SEIA's as well as the progress made to the industry development. ➤ The RGC, Ministry of Information, particularly Radio National Kampuchea establishes and broadcasts programme on mineral exploration and extraction. ➤ The RGC will continue to actively involve civil society in all appropriate aspects of RGC's planning and decision making. The involvement of civil society in public consultation enables them to deliver meaningful contribution/inputs to RGC for taking Cambodia's forward.

44	158, <i>Bullet point #1</i>	<p>Paragraph 158, Bullet point #1: Get maximum revenues to the state through.... MEF has done considerable advance thinking to examine all available options. Besides, RGC is examining the Extractive Industry Transparency Initiatives (EITI).....</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We kindly suggest: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➢ The inclusion of safeguards for human rights and other social protection be included in the above text including the reflection on how the revenue generated from exploration activities will contribute to poverty alleviation and equitable development or all Cambodians.
44	158, <i>bullet point #2</i>	<p>Paragraph 158, Bullet point # 2: Set up mechanisms and bodies to guide this sector and monitor operations...</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We kindly suggest: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➢ The RGC will establish independent public agency (by inter-ministries: MIME, MOE and Ministry of Health) with the mandate, resources and expertise to continuously monitors under the supervision of Protected Area/Forestry (PA/F) authorities should monitor all exploration activities within PA/F and other biologically sensitive areas important for ecological services and local livelihoods. ➢ The EIA Department of MOE also collaborate with NGOs and private citizens who wish to participate in the environmental planning process. This could entail the creation of a platform to solicit comments and input from representatives of NGOs such as the Extractive Industry Social and Environmental Impact (EISEI) network who can share their observations and evidence on environmental impacts associated with projects under review by the MOE. Such a mechanism would be cost effective and would contribute to increased public participation and linkages between the state and its citizens.
46	161, <i>last sentence</i>	<p>Paragraph 161, last sentence: The Royal Government of Cambodia has pursued an export-led, pro-poor growth strategy focused on diversifying and broadening the economic base and...</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We kindly suggest: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➢ There needs to be a reform in the policies and legislation to be accountable and transparent in order to attract socially responsible corporations, businesses and investment.

46	162	Paragraph 162: The Government-Private Sector Forum...Also the management of mineral ore resources... <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We kindly suggest: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➢ This forum should be used to attract socially and environmentally responsible businesses and to initiate policy and legislative reform in regard to extractive industry accountability and transparency.
50	181	Paragraph 181 : Oil, Gas and Mineral Exploration <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We kindly suggest: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➢ Any new applications for oil, gas or mineral concessions that overlap Protected Area and Forest (PA/F) will be reviewed by the technical agency responsible for management, e.g., MOE/Administration of Nature Conservation and Protection and MAFF/FA, plus any other relevant stakeholders, as required by Article 10 of Environmental Protection Law and Article 4 and 35 of the Forestry Law. ➢ The RGC, especially the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) department of Ministry of Environment will revise EIA guidelines to require multiple stakeholder participation and the meaningful fulfilment of their objectives. ➢ Review and revise current laws and legislations pertaining to the oil, gas and mineral extraction sector to adequately reflect international standards of the industry to ensure social and environmental safeguards and standards in the sector; including best practices for occupational health, safety and environmental protection, ISO, biodiversity conservation and sustainable natural resource management. ➢ The RGC, especially MIME will compile all mineral resource deposit data and develop a national mineral resource management strategy before offering extraction rights to ensure sustainable use. This will mitigate negative social and environmental impacts. ➢ The RGC focus on developing capacity for cooperation and support from provincial authorities to monitor mineral exploration and extraction implemented by mining companies at the local level for better law enforcement and management.
125-126	421	Paragraph 421, items i – iv: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We kindly suggest:

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Strengthening enforcement of environmental regulations in order to ensure that an appropriate EIA or SEIA is completed before project commencement. This entails strengthening MOE review times to ensure adequate analysis, ensuring the public right to comment and monitoring implementation of approved mitigation measures; ➤ Formulate and enforce comprehensive and consistent national air, water and noise pollution standards; ➤ Collaborate with other ministries (i.e. MIME, MWRM, MAFF etc.) to produce a comprehensive and universally accepted management plan for existing conservation and important forested areas that forbids development that is not compatible with the preservation and conservation of cultural and natural resources; as reflected in the current National Forestry Programme.
126	423	<p>Paragraph 423: In the area of <i>environmental impact assessment</i>, the MOE will ensure sustainable use of natural resources and economic sustainability of the sector by conducting environmental impact assessments before development projects are implemented by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We kindly suggest: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ That the implementation of EIAs and SEIAs be enforced as stated above and made public for review. All laws contradicting the above statement such as the Law on Mineral Extraction are amended to reflect the NSDP and existing regulations of the MOE.
126	423	<p>Paragraph 423, bullet points 1-3,</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We kindly suggest: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Involve civil society (i.e. private citizens, NGOs, etc.) and government (i.e. ministries, universities, etc.) in MOE's efforts to strengthen technical capacity, to prepare and edit legislation and policy, and to monitor environmental management plans. With many citizens, organizations and government entities concerned about Cambodia's environment, the MOE could leverage the experience and expertise of many entities active at all levels of Cambodian government and society to achieve these goals.
126	424	<p>Paragraph 424, bullet points 1-7,</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We kindly suggest:

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Involve existing national level experts and engage international entities in MOE's efforts to strengthen pollution control measures. Strengthen enforcement of existing regulations to obligate government and private sector entities responsible for air, groundwater, noise, and surface water pollution to work with the MOE to create innovative solutions that can be used to solve and/or mitigate existing and future problems. Finally, MOE should make public all standards and prescribed mitigation measures relating to any pollution control measures adopted by the ministry.
126-127	425	<p>Paragraph 425, bullet points 3 and 7 (data management, strengthen management and conservation).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We kindly suggest: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ The MOE should construct an official, public, national level database for protected and non-protected areas containing maps, land use data, and final versions of EIAs approved by the agency; ➤ The MOE should strengthen the management and conservation of wetlands, biosphere reservations, coastal zones, etc. through establishing a consistent and enforceable set of acceptable land uses for such places. Acceptable land uses should exclude logging, extractive industry or development that exceeds the carrying capacity of the existing ecosystem.
127	426	<p>Paragraph 426</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We kindly suggest: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ As a means to reach communities, the MOE should include concerned civil society groups in its education and information campaigns. This would also provide valuable opportunities to exchange information and promote dialogue between government, communities and civil society.
135	450	<p>Paragraph 450: In the programme area, draft and enact regulations and built partnership with the private sector to promote sector participation.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We kindly suggest: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ All responsible government agencies enforce a moratorium on the granting of exploration and extraction licenses

		<p>in indigenous areas until indigenous communal land titling is completed.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ The RGC provide MIME, MOE, FA and Ministry of Health with the mandate, resources and expertise to continuously oversee all aspects of the award of rights including the monitoring of health and socio-cultural impacts.
137	452	<p>Paragraph 452, bullet points 1-2 :</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We kindly suggest: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ MIME should include information on significant adverse environmental impacts from mining in its campaign to raise awareness about safe water and sanitation; ➤ When selecting 5 areas to integrate environmental management into sanitation schemes, MIME should select 5 municipalities containing areas where MIME has given mining exploration licenses. This provides MIME with an opportunity to engage communities and to provide mitigation for any potential water quality issues associated with existing or future mining activity.
138	457	<p>Paragraph 457: The Royal Government of Cambodia considers oil and gas resources as a unique potential to ensure energy security.....</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We kindly suggest: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ The RGC investigate alternative sources of energy which are more environmentally sustainable and socially equitable to further secure Cambodia's energy needs. ➤ The RGC develop policies and legislation with public consultation. ➤ The RGC seek cooperation and support from provincial authorities to monitor mineral exploration and extraction implemented by mining companies at the local level for better management.
138	458	<p>Paragraph 458: The RGC encourage the use of efficient energy with minimal impacts on the environment.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We kindly suggest:

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ The RGC develop and implement a national policy for social and environmental responsibility in the extractive industries sector. ➤ The RGC, especially the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) department of Ministry of Environment, revise environmental impact assessment (EIA) guidelines to require multiple stakeholder participation and the meaningful fulfilment of their objectives. ➤ The RGC, especially MIME compile all mineral resource deposit data and develop, and make public, a national mineral resource management strategy before offering extraction rights to ensure sustainable use. This will mitigate negative social and environmental impacts.
--	--	--

Contact Information

For more information on this sectoral comment, please contact:

Development and Partnership in Action (DPA)

Mr. Mam Sambath
Executive Director of DPA
The EISeI Steering Committee
Tel: 855-23 216 495
Email: mam.sambath@citylink.com.kh

6. Extractive Industry Revenue Management

Page*	Para-number**	NGO Comment
44-45	158.	<p>We kindly suggest:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The first sentences change to “Both onshore and offshore oil and gas fields. are a common asset of all Cambodians, now and in the future...” • Move the five priorities in paragraph 158 to chapter four paragraphs 368 of the NSDP Update where key policies and actions taken by line ministries are discussed. • Update the situation analysis with current expectations on when revenues will come on stream. <p>We would like to suggest the following additions to the achievements for 2006-2009:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The establishment of the Inter-ministerial Working group for the development of Action Plan and Monitoring of Implementation of Mobilization and Management of Revenues from Oil and Gas and Mining as per directive (No. 10 SSR) issued by the Prime Minister on 4 February 2009 . <p>The Technical Working Group falls under the committee for public financial management reform and will develop an action plan on management of the revenues from oil, gas, and mining; monitor the implementation of the action plan; and other duties described in the directive. It consists of representatives of the MEF, COM, MIME, MOP, CNPA, MoE, CDC, MoC, MoJ, MoLMUC, and Mol.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The disclosure of revenue stream and other payments coming from oil, gas, and mining companies has been included in the TOFE since 2009 and is regularly update on the MEF website. <p>We would like to suggest to add the below challenge for 2006-2009</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The revenue earned from oil, gas and mining contracts such as royalty, signature bonuses, and fee paid for contract extension are currently listed as “Non tax revenue from oil and gas sector” on the MOEF’s Table of Revenues from Tax and Non-tax. Because these revenues are currently not being taxed, it is difficult to harmonize tax law contracts in order to create a more favorable investment environment.

81	276	<p>We kindly suggest to add:</p> <p>With the RGC stating that a significant flow of revenue from oil and gas is expected to begin in 2011, the RGC will develop new contingency plans to deal with the expected influx of resource revenue monies. These contingencies will include investment strategies (e.g., subsidies and tax relief) in order to insure that vulnerable sectors of the Cambodian economy—such as agriculture, garment manufacturing, tourism, and construction—stay competitive after an influx of new oil and/or gas revenues.</p>
99	325	MONASRY will develop Law on Access to Information.
111	368.	<p>While the policy priority is clearly articulated, the NSDP Update does not elaborate on how this policy priority will be implemented. We suggest that under section B (planned actions to implement the prioritized policies) elaborate on how the Royal Government will ensure that revenues from mineral resources, oil, and gas will be managed efficiently and transparently as well as how the RGC will account for the use of these revenues. The inclusion of the RGC plans presented for the National Assembly in November 2009 would be a valuable addition:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Finalize workplan of the Inter-ministerial Working group for the development of Monitoring of Implementation of Mobilization and Management of Revenues from Oil and Gas and Mining and hold public consultations on the content with mechanisms in early 2010. • Hold broad consultations with civil society organizations about the content of the workplan and discuss civil society's involvement in implementation and monitoring of the plan in early 2010. • A system will be created where revenues from EI will be reported on the TOFE in greater detail with revenues broken down by category. This will be included in the monthly TOFE that is posted on the MEF website in 2010. • MEF will establish an effective mechanism for information sharing among different revenue collecting agencies and the policy department of the MEF to ensure timely and effective reporting of oil, gas, and mining earning received by the Government. The RGC will simplify the revenue collection stream as well as its spending in order to simplify the auditing process. • MEF will share information related to contracts and payment, with NGOs, Development Partners and other concerned stakeholders to increase transparency. • Development partners support capacity building of the relevant Government authorities to ensure that revenue

		<p>information reported by companies is correct;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • MEF will commission a technical study on “Capacity Needs Assessment” to review Cambodia’s regulatory and institutional position with a view to improve management efficiency and increase local content in the petroleum and mining sectors. Activities to cover identified capacity needs will be formulated and implemented. • At this point, the five bullets from paragraph 158 could be inserted as these are policy statements relevant for the 2009-2013 period. • In order to operationalize the transparent management of the sector as indicated in paragraphs 367 and 368 of the draft NSDP Update: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ◦ RGC will promote transparently designed arrangements of contracts and open bidding process as this can help the government with more accurate cash flow projection as well as increase in the level of competition among companies, which will not only reduce the risk of cronyism, but also encourage quality FDI. ◦ the CNPA and MIME should disclose a list with all companies with granted and pending licenses for exploration / exploitation of oil, gas, minerals and other extractive natural resources. These lists should be published on the websites of the Ministry of Mines and Energy (MIME) and the Cambodian National Petroleum Authority (CNPA) ◦ MEF posts the work plan of the inter-ministerial working group on its website
138	457.	<p>The paragraph 457 we kindly suggest to add:</p> <p>The intentions in para 457 are clear and need to be elaborated upon in section B (planned actions to implement the prioritized policies). We suggest the following activities should be included in the law development process:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Relevant line ministries will finalize laws and regulations associated with taxation and oil and gas and mining industry management by 2010. The development partners and civil society will kept informed of the progress. • The draft Petroleum Law has been sent for comments to the Council of Ministers in 2009 and is expected to be sent to the National Assembly in 2010. The government will widely consult with relevant government institutions, development partners as well as civil society organizations before the draft Petroleum Law submit to national

		assembly for adoption.
--	--	------------------------

* The page number refers to the page-number of the first draft NSDP update 2009-2013.

** The para-number refers to the paragraph-number of the first draft NSDP update 2009-2013.

Contact information:

For more information on this sectoral comment, please contact:

Cambodians for Resource Revenue Transparency (CRRT)

Mr. Mam Sambath, CRRT Chairman

Tel: (855-23) 217 607

Email: mam_sambath@citylink.com.kh

Website: www.crrt_cambodia.org.kh

7. Access to Information

Page*	Para_number**	Original Text from the first draft NSDP Update 2009-2013	NGO Comment
97	321	Public support and Participation: Public support and participation is sine qua non for effectively preventing, reducing and fighting corruption. For this, the Government will continue to further promotion and protect the freedom to seek to obtain and to disseminate information on corrupt cases in the media. However, this should be done in a credible and responsible manner by respecting the rights, honor and dignity of people involved while protecting national security and public order	Access to information is sine qua non to promote transparency and public participation. It strengthens the connection and builds the trust and confidence between the government and citizens as soon as they get sufficient information. CSOs would like to strongly request that the NSDP Update 2009-2013 includes the law on access to information as a prioritized policy for the fourth legislature to protect the freedom to seek to obtain and disseminate information.
100	325	To implement REC's priority policies, MONASRI will focus on: iii. Strengthening institutions and human resources development in order to increase its institutional capacity at the headquarters and provincial and municipal department to: (1) to continue drafting the laws on inspection, procedure on inspection, and policy on access to information, (2)....	Since the Access to Information policy framework has been only drafted by the Ministry of National Assembly Senate Relation and Inspection and has never been approved by the Council of Ministers to become a legal document to be used as the guidelines for developing an Access to Information Law, we would like to strongly request that the NSDP Update 2009-2013 includes a clear mandate and timeframe for the development of the Access to Information legislation. In addition, the NSDP update should be included strategies, procedures and mechanisms enabling effective implementation of the Access to Information Law once it is enacted.

* The page number refers to the page-number of the first draft NSDP Update 2009-2013.

** The para-number refers to the paragraph-number of the first draft NSDP Update 2009-2013.

Contact Information

For more information on this sectoral comment, please contact:

The Advocacy and Policy Institute (API)

Mr. Sinhay Neb, API Director, representing for Freedom of Information Working Group

Tel: (855-23) 213 486 or (855-12) 527 004

Email: apioffice@apiinstitute.org or sinthyayneb@apiinstitute.org

Website: www.apiinstitute.org

Address: Phnom Penh Center, Building F, 4th Floor, Room 484,
Corner Shihanouk and Sotheas Blvd, Sangkat Tonle Bassac, Khan Chamkarmorn, Phnom Penh, Kingdom of Cambodia

MEMBERS OF FREEDOM OF INFORMATION WORKING GROUP

- | | |
|-----|---|
| No. | Name of organization |
| 1 | Advocacy and Policy Institute (API) |
| 2 | Cambodia Human Rights Action Committee (CHRAC) |
| 3 | Cambodian Human Rights and Development Association (ADHOC) |
| 4 | Cambodian Enterprise Development Organization (CEDO) |
| 5 | Centre for Social Development (CSD) |
| 6 | Committee for Free and Fair Elections in Cambodia (COMFREL) |
| 7 | Community Legal Education Centre (CLEC) |
| 8 | Conservation and Development on Cambodia (CDCAM) |
| 9 | Equal Access |
| 10 | Khmer Institute for Democracy (KID) |
| 11 | Khmer Woman voice centre (KWVC) |
| 12 | Khmer Youth Association (KYA) |
| 13 | Neutral & Impartial Committee for Free & Fair Election in Cambodia (NICFEC) |
| 14 | Open Forum of Cambodia (OFC) |
| 15 | Pact Cambodia |
| 16 | People Centre for Development and Peace (PDP Centre) |
| 17 | Star Kampuchea (SK) |
| 18 | Voice of Democracy (VOD)/CCIM |
| 19 | Women's Media Centre of Cambodia (WMC) |

8. Good Governance/ Anti-Corruption

Page *	Para Number **	Original Text from the first draft NSDP Update 2009 – 2013	NGO Comment
A. Policy Priorities for the Fourth Legislature (Page 97)			
97	Under 321 First Bullet	<p>▪ Preventative Measures: The Royal Government will continue to raise awareness about all aspects of corruption, including its causes, impacts and consequences to encourage public participant in preventing and fighting corruption. Concrete measure will pursue to encourage all levels of government officials to adhere to dignity, morality, professionalism and responsibility in fulfilling their duties.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ We would like to see also in the NSDP update 2009-2013 that actions taken by the Government against corruption be conducted and reported out on a regular basis, with data available and accessible to the public. ▪ Public education/awareness raising should be fully mainstreamed into the public domain and should be of a broader scope and with many different tools. ▪ In addition, we would like to request that, for public education, it should be clearly stated that all stakeholders, both state and non-state actors should be engaged. The awareness should be included the dialogue for the implementing. The suggested paragraph should be modified as following: Preventative Measures: The Royal Government will continue to raise awareness about all aspects of corruption, including its causes, impacts and consequences to encourage public participant <u>through dialogue and provide opportunities to all</u> stakeholders, both state and non-state actors such as NGOs, private sectors <u>actively involved</u> in preventing and fighting corruption. Concrete measure will pursue to encourage all levels of government officials to adhere to dignity, morality, professionalism and responsibility in fulfilling their duties.
98	under	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Public support and participation: Public support and participation is sine qua non for effectively preventing, 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➢ For this bullet we strongly suggest to remove the following sentence: However, this should be

	321 Third Bullet	reducing and fighting corruption. For this Government will also continue to further promote and protect the freedom to obtain and to disseminate information on corrupt cases in the media. However, this should be done in a credible and responsible manner by respecting the rights, honor and dignity of people involved while protecting national security and public order.	<u>done in a credible and responsible manner by respecting the rights, honor and dignity of people involved while protecting national security and public order.</u>
97	Fifth Bullet New Bullet	Do not have in draft	We would like, under (A - 321), NSDP should add one more bullet (Bullet No. 5) to disclose <u>"all establishment/creation sub-degrees/policies to support for implementing the ACL that will allow Civil Society and Stakeholders to involve in the whole draft process".</u>

B. Planned Actions to implement the Prioritized Policies (page 98)

In the update of the first draft NSDP Update 2009 – 2013 is unclear about the type of complaints that ACU will handle and the type of complaints that MoNASRI will handle. To avoid confusion, the document should specify if these are different types of complaints or not. If they are not different complaints, the document needs to provide greater clarity on the roles of ACU and MoNASRI in relation to corruption complaints handling.

The draft NSDP Update 2009 – 2013 should provide the details on how the Office for Receipt of Complaints works with clear references to those that have been addressed and those were not addressed and why. We would like to request also that in the NSDP Update the complaint mechanism be expanded to every government office and a system be set up to provide a regular update to the public on its progress of work.

Moreover, the NSDP Update should provides clear references to different categories of actions taken against different groups of people for different acts of corruption, and that all the information be updated systematically right from the beginning to the end process.

98	Under 323	i.Prevention <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Continue to raise awareness about all aspects of corruption, including its cause, impacts and consequences to encourage public participation in 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Prevention is an extremely important tool to address corruption. The stronger and/or the more effective the prevention is the less enforcement/legal actions are needed. Therefore we would like to strongly request
----	--------------	---	--

		<p>preventing and fighting corruption</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Concrete measures will be pursued to encourage all levels of government officials to adhere to dignity, morality, professionalism and responsibility in fulfilling their duty 	<p>that the NSDP Update clearly mandates the establishment and enforcement of preventive mechanisms. This could start with the mapping of corruption vulnerability and/or assessment of integrity risks in the administrative system and then set up mechanisms to address and enforce them</p>
--	--	---	---

* The page refers to the page number of the first draft NSDP Update 2009 – 2013.

** The para-number refers to the paragraph number of the first draft NSDP Update 2009 – 2013.

Contact Information

For more information on the sectoral comment, please contact:

Coalition of Integrity and Social Accountability (CISA)
 Mr. Yong Kim Eng
 Tel: 016 828 211
 Fax: 855- 23 883 304
 E-mail: kimeng_yong@yahoo.com

9. Child Right

Page*	Para-number**	NGO Comment
168	329 4 th Point	We would like to propose to the council of legal and judicial reform, Ministry of Justice and relevant ministries integrate another draft law which is draft Law on Juvenile Justice into the development of the action plans to implement the prioritized policies of the Royal Government of Cambodia for the 4 th legislature of the National Assembly.
169	329 5 th Point	Propose for the integration of the preparation or establishment of the Juvenile Justice System.
256	511	Propose for indicating the number of school, teachers, enrollment rate, percentage of National budget allocated for the MoEYS from the previous years.
256	512	Propose for linking of policy in eliminating child labor, especially elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labor that the Government has set up in 2015.
256	513	Propose for controlling on improving of the quality of education and take action against teachers who asked for money from students and committed violence in class, which affected the government education plan in continuing the improvement of education quality.
261	520	Propose for the amendment to the Law on Education or integrate into Educational Plan to ensure that children in prison get access to education.
261	520 3 rd point	Propose for mainstreaming of child rights, especially rights to education into educational policy and real practice. And propose to the government to increase teachers' salary as well as giving them the salary on time.
267	527 4 th point, paragraph 4	Propose to integrate all legal measure to the private hospitals that are operating and that caused people's life injurious and that they did not apply the code of ethnic.
273	537	Propose: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Raise awareness of the equal right of girls to secondary and higher education, and increase access by providing financial assistance and addressing cultural roots of discrimination. - Assure safety of girls in going to and from school. - Promote the benefits of education for girls in terms of improved earning, marital and parenting skills.
274	540	Propose for the integration of the concepts and implementation of the international laws such as CEDAW and UN Convention on the Rights of the Child.

276	541	Propose for reducing cultural taboos against sex education by promoting its safety and health benefits, while assuring parents that providing appropriate information and education in this area does not encourage children to experiment sexually.
-----	-----	--

* The page number refers to the page-number of the first draft NSDP Update 2009-2013.

** The para-number refers to the paragraph-number of the first draft NSDP Update 2009-2013.

Contact Information

NGO Committee on the Rights of the Child (NGO CRC)

Mr.Meas Samnang, Secretary General

Tel: 023 882 412

Fax: N/A

Email: info@ngocrc.org

Website: www.ngocrc.org

10. Hydropower Development and Energy Sector

Page*	Para_Number**	Suggestions/comments for the NSDP Update
34	115	<p>In spite of significant progress made the fisheries sector still face many challenges:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We would like to kindly recommend that reference is given to the challenge of preventing and mitigating negative impacts on fisheries caused by hydropower development projects in Cambodia and the Mekong region. As fisheries supply approximately 82% of Cambodia's animal protein, hydropower in the Mekong River basin will also significantly impact Cambodia's food security. Special attention will need to be given in the future to ensure that Cambodia's energy development does not negatively impact Cambodia's fisheries in terms of catch and species.
36	123	<p>According to the letter on December 27, 2009, from 3S (Sesan, Srepok, Sekong) River communities to the Cambodian National Mekong Committee (CNMC), communities sent a three-page report regarding poor water quality in the Sesan, Srepok and Sekong rivers. Communities are concerned that the bad water quality of these rivers may have been caused by the operation of hydropower dams upstream the rivers in Vietnam and the construction of the Lower Sesan 2 hydropower dam project in Stung Treng. Additionally, a 2009 Technical Brief (Issue No.12) by STRIVER confirmed the presence of cyanobacteria, algae toxin microsystin, thermo-tolerant coliform bacteria and E. Coli in the Sesan River in Cambodia. The poor water quality and its health-related impacts were linked to stagnant water in reservoirs located upstream in Vietnam.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We would like to kindly recommend that monitoring water quality for biodiversity conservation should include areas having abundant biodiversity, such as the Tonle Sap Lake, sites along the whole stretch of the Mekong River and along its 3S tributaries (Sesan, Srepok, Sekong rivers). The government and relevant stakeholders have to ensure the water quality of the rivers is acceptable for both biodiversity and people. Water quality monitoring should include both environmental and health related parameters. Additionally, we would like to request that the government should carry out an investigation into these reports and seek compensation and mitigation from Vietnam for the water-related illness and deaths suffered by Cambodians due to upstream hydropower development.
36	128	<p>Attention should be brought to the erratic water fluctuation issues being suffered by communities on Sesan and Srepok rivers due to upstream hydropower development in Vietnam by Cambodia's Standing Committee on Coordination of Dams-Canal Along Border of Cambodia, Vietnam, Laos and Thailand.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We would like to kindly recommend that Cambodia should seek to ensure that Vietnam adheres to the past

Page*	Para Number**	Suggestions/comments for the NSDP Update
		commitments it has given to Cambodia of building the Sesan 4a and Srepok 4a re-regulating reservoirs (made at the 12 January 2007 STAKEHOLDER MEETING ON ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT (EIA) ON THE CAMBODIAN PART OF SREPOK RIVER DUE TO HYDROPOWER DEVELOPMENT IN VIETNAM Workshop), and improving water release notification systems (the 5 Solutions agreement).
43	115	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We would like to kindly suggest that the challenge of high water demand for energy development (hydropower and coal fired plants) and irrigation projects be added to the list of challenges, as these projects may cause future conflict of water resource usage and may lead to water shortages thus impacting the urban and rural public's demands for water.
44	157	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We would like to kindly suggest that information on the challenges being faced in implementing the Rural Electrification Master Plan should also be mentioned.
124	415	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We would like to kindly suggest that the Fishery Administration carry out research and public dialogue events on the subject of hydropower dams and fishery mitigation technologies. The Fisheries Administration should seek to ensure that proper mechanisms for the mitigation of fisheries impacts caused by hydropower dams is promoted and in cases where technologies do not exist to mitigate fishery impacts the Fisheries Administration carries out an awareness raising campaign for the public and government, in order to help informed decision-making processes.
125	419	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We would like to kindly recommend that the government (Forestry Administration) should ensure that no illegal logging occurs in protected areas during the clearing of forest for the reservoir sites of hydropower dams. This should be done through proper monitoring and strict enforcement of laws. Replantation of lost forests is also encouraged and any prior commitments made by hydropower companies to replant should also be adhered to. Moreover, as forest is an important area of wildlife habitat, we would like to recommend that the MoE help define a suitable mechanism to help protect and conserve endangered species and nearly extinct wildlife during the hydropower construction and operation period.
126	422	<p>The MOE will prepare legislation and documentary by: Preparing guidelines on prepare environmental impact assessment report</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We would like to kindly recommend that the preparation of the EIA guidelines is done in consultation with civil society and includes detailed guidelines on how to determine when an IEIA vs. and EIA is needed for projects and detailed guidelines on how to carry out meaningful public participation processes in the EIA.

Page*	Para Number**	Suggestions/comments for the NSDP Update
127	425	<p>Original text: Accelerate implementation of green house gas emission projects</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We would like to kindly recommend that the RGC should consider and approve electricity generation from energy sources that do not emit greenhouse gases (GHG) into the atmosphere. We would like to encourage the government to promote clean and modern technology power generation such as biogas, biomass, solar and wind turbines, while also avoiding the development of hydropower and coal fired power plants given their green-house gas emissions. • We would also like to kindly recommend that the English language used in the NSDP is improved to state that the MoE will work to accelerate the implementation of greenhouse gas emission reduction projects.
	428	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • As most of the people living along rivers are dependent on water for fishing, transportation, daily household usage, etc., we would like to kindly recommend that the government prioritize in the national plan projects to improve access to safe water for the communities who have been negatively affected by hydropower dam development projects in both Vietnam and Cambodia.
132	443	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We would like to kindly recommend that MWRAM add a point to include the study and consideration of the Basin Development Plan Phase 2 into the country's development planning process, which includes stakeholder's participation. • We would also like to kindly recommend that MWRAM increase the capacity of its staff and relevant ministries to understand the concept of Integrated-Water Resource Management (IWRM) and begin implementation of this principle into its work (as mentioned in the Water Law)
134	445	<p>ii. Strengthen and encourage the implementation of Water Resources Management Law and other related provisions to monitor and prevent all rehabilitation and construction projects that might have adverse impact on water resources and eco-system.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • As public participation is a key aspect to informed decision-making, we would like to kindly recommend the RGC include information on how it will ensure public participation in hydropower decision-making processes in order to prevent adverse impacts on water resources. Mention should also be given to Cambodia's commitment to ensuring the management of development of water resources according to integrated water resources management (Article 4 of 2007 Law on Water Resources Management). Evaluation on how Cambodia has applied IWRM in its hydropower development, especially in terms of participatory planning and stakeholder involvement, should be made in its evaluation process.

Page*	Para Number**	Suggestions/comments for the NSDP Update
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ensure that development projects such as hydropower dams, coal fired plants, and irrigation projects undergo all necessary legal requirements, such as carrying out EIA laws, prior to providing licenses or permits for water use.
137	454	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We would like to suggest that the Ministry of Industry, Mine and Energy (MIME) develop a new master plan, which incorporates rural and urban electrification plans and incorporates all energy technologies into one plan. This master plan should include government plans to promote private investment in sustainable alternative energy options (which are environmentally and socially acceptable), along with government plans including the Hydropower Master Plan prepared by JICA and the Rural Electrification Plan. • The Royal Government of Cambodia has made a commitment to encouraging “exploration and environmentally and socially acceptable development resources needed for supply to all sectors of the Cambodian economy,” in its Power Sector Development Policy. We would suggest MIME to put this commitment into the NSDP Update 2009-20013.
138	455	<p>In order to reduce poverty and ensure harmony in the lives of people in the rural areas, the Royal Government will continue to attach priority to accelerate rural electrification, including the use of renewable energy.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We would like to kindly recommend that the RGC gives high priority towards the development of decentralized renewable energy generation based on sustainable forms of energy as it works towards accelerating rural electrification. In order to do this, we would like the RGC to kindly consider encouraging and prioritizing decentralized energy generation through more environmentally and socially acceptable technologies, while also introducing policy changes that encourage decentralized generation. We recommend the following that RGC implement the following policy and regulatory initiatives: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Introduce customer financing programs to help all households, businesses, and communities finance the upfront capital costs of build-scale and industrial-scale generating technologies over a 5 to 10 year period 2) Open the market to decentralized generation by announcing specific policies pertaining to the leading technologies, and impose no cap on the amount of power each produce 3) Invite competitive bids for new decentralized generating capacity additions, by service territory and in low-risk increments of several megawatts, as different markets require 4) Give all power generators non-discriminatory access to local distribution grids and introduce interconnection standards that accommodate all producers 5) Provide investors and project developers with the stability and price signals they need by providing a

Page*	Para Number**	Suggestions/comments for the NSDP Update
		<p>transparent and explicit mechanism for tariff-setting and cost recovery.</p> <p>6) Establish explicit and transparent step-by-step procedures for obtaining permits and public approval.</p> <p>7) Make proof of community and land rights holder' approval for project siting a prerequisite to licensing by the regulatory authority.</p> <p>A more modern energy approach will allow the country to produce energy in an efficient and sustainable manner while avoiding expensive, environmentally damaging, high-risk investments in old technologies such as hydropower dams and coal-fired plants, while also better meeting the energy needs of the people and country.</p>
138	458	<p>The Royal Government encourages the use of efficient energy with minimal impact on the environment.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We would like to kindly recommend that the RGC also should add information on how the RGC will mitigate and compensate for the impacts caused by energy projects ,as much of Cambodia's poor men and women, especially its ethnic minorities, who depend on the country's natural resources, especially fisheries and agriculture land, as a source of livelihood and food security. Detailed information should be provided on which stakeholders are responsible for developing and implementing mitigation measures.
138	459	<p>iii. Developing policy, legal and regulatory framework for energy sector in order to ensure efficient management and resources utilisation for economic development and improvement in livelihoods of the Cambodian people.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In order to develop policy, legal and regulatory framework for the energy sector that improves the livelihoods of Cambodian people, we would like to kindly recommend that the RGC seek to develop legal framework on hydropower and also develop a benefit-sharing law, in order to ensure directly and indirectly affected communities are positively impacted from the development of hydropower dams. We would also like to encourage the government to commit to the implementation of international best practice standards, such as those outlined by the World Commission on Dams, in the planning, construction and operation phases of hydropower development.
138	460	<p>Promote the use of local energy sources such as hydro power, natural gas and coal.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We would like to kindly recommend that the RGC also commit to promoting and <i>prioritizing</i> the use of sustainable renewable energies in order to meet the electricity needs of Cambodia. The government should also encourage updating its energy planning process to include the exploration of more sustainable modern

Page*	Para Number**	Suggestions/comments for the NSDP Update
		energy sources, rather than environmentally and socially destructive hydro power and coal fired plants.
138	460	<p>Make further efforts to mitigate adverse effects on environment and society in the implementation of energy projects while safeguarding economic efficiency of each project.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We would like to kindly recommend that the RGC also mention safeguarding the rights of local communities who will be adversely impacted by energy development, in order to work towards sustainable development. The Government should also commit to the long-term sharing of benefits of hydropower dams with communities affected by these projects. We would recommend providing affected communities with a certain percentage of the project's revenue based on each kilowatt of electricity produced, in order to help ensure that these communities also benefit from the development of dams.
142	472	<p>I. Strengthening Private Sector and Attracting Investment B. Planned Actions to Implement the Prioritized Policies</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We would like to kindly suggest that the CDC include mention on how the Royal Government of Cambodia will encourage the investment of alternative energies which are both environmentally and socially acceptable. • The NSDP Update 2009-2013 should list or provide reference to the current status of in-country projects being implemented so that the public knows the current status of energy development in Cambodia.
166	537	<p>Women and children are the most vulnerable from the negative impacts of hydropower dam development. Hydropower dam development negatively impacts the ability of women in affected communities to access natural resources for supporting their livelihoods and food security needs, including access to fisheries agricultural products, plantation, water sanitation and health. The above issues and solutions should integrated into the updated NSDP 2009-2013.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We would like to kindly recommend that the government and relevant stakeholders integrate resolution mechanism and plans to reduce the challenges faced by women in communities affected by hydropower dam development into the update NSDP 2009-2013, in order to ensure the promotion of better living conditions for women in local communities. • We would like to strongly recommend to increase the involvement of women into the process of decision making for all kinds of development projects and community development. We would like to encourage all

Page*	Para Number**	Suggestions/comments for the NSDP Update
		levels of government to consider and accept the concerns, suggestions and recommendations of women into the plans of the government. In addition, women in local communities should be encouraged and empowered to become active participants in decision-making through providing capacity building opportunities and more.

Contact Information:

For more information on the sectoral comment, please contact:

The NGO Forum on Cambodia
 Chea Phallika, Hydropower and Community Rights Project Officer
TEL: +855 23 214 429 Ext. No 106
Fax: +855 23 994 063
Email: phallika@ngoforum.org.kh
Website: www.ngoforum.org.kh

11. Environment Protection, Conservation and Climate Change

Page*	Para_number**	NGOs Comments
35	118	<p>The protection of conservation areas is very important for Cambodia's sustainable development. In order to help ensure poverty alleviation in rural areas, the Royal Government of Cambodia should ensure the sufficient use of natural resources to meet the demands in the present, while protecting reserves for future needs.</p> <p>Rural livelihoods of local communities are dependent on the environment and natural resources, especially in areas of fisheries and Non Timber Forest Products (NTFPs). Environmental Impact Assessments (following EIA guidelines and other relevant laws of the RGC) are required for most development projects, in order to ensure environmental protection. To date, EIA reports for development projects are observed to be of low quality, lack adequate public participation and stakeholder consultation, have few mitigation measures to protect the environment, while also having vague environmental management plans with no benefit sharing with affected communities and lack monitoring to ensure commitments are followed. At the same time, the draft EIA guidelines have not yet been approved, while the EIA reports that do exist have been shared with civil society organizations with only a short period of time for review and providing comments. Affected communities have not yet been included in the consultation process.</p> <p>According to above comments, we would like to kindly suggest the following recommendations to the Ministry of Environment:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Improve cooperation with relevant line ministries and civil society, in order to hold joint investigations and monitoring of development project's EMP, to implement existing laws and take action as needed. - Improve the draft EIA Guidelines by incorporating comments from civil society and relevant stakeholders, in order to help address some of the key concerns mentioned above.
35	119	<p>Although the Ministry of Environment has been implementing important programs to address environmental issues, we have observed that there are still many outstanding environmental issues in Cambodia, which have been caused by development projects: Tran boundary impacts (water quality, ecology of Sesan River and impacts to livelihoods) of Vietnam's Yali dam on Sesan communities in Cambodia; sand dredging; coastal development; human health impacts of the paper factory in Sangkat Chak Angre; chemical pollution in the Mekong River and Tonle Sap Lake due to chemical and pesticide usage; mining impacts; lack of solid waste management and investment in the protected areas.</p> <p>While Cambodia needs development, the RGC should also take care to prioritize projects that contribute to sustainable development while avoiding high environmental risk projects. We would like to kindly recommend that the Ministry of Environment should prioritize the resolution of existing environmental issues, while also cooperating with relevant line</p>

		ministries, civil society and communities, in order to begin addressing the above mentioned issues.
35	120	<p>We would like to suggest that the government, especially the Ministry of Environment, provide information on how many EIAs have been submitted vs. how many EIAs have been reviewed by the MoE. We would also like to suggest that the MoE provide reference to where the public can view copies of the EIA reports and the environmental protection agreements which have been signed. Additionally, the MoE should ensure that all EIA reports being reviewed are open to public scrutiny, in order for stakeholders to review and provide comments, ensure accuracy of information, and help to ensure proper mitigation mechanisms for environmental protection.</p>
35	121	<p>The volume of the solid waste has increased year by year. The data provided within the NSDP should be reviewed for accuracy, since the data does not fit with the recent study conducted by KOICA, as mentioned in Rasmei Kampuchea newspaper, which estimated that the volume of solid waste in Phnom Penh has reached 1,100 tons per day. (Rasmei Kampuchea, Year 17, No: 5084 Date: 27-28 Dec 2009). The amount of solid waste and garbage collected has increased more than 200 tons within 3 years, which has contributed to the development of more waste collection sites. These waste collection sites may have impacts on the health of communities living around the dump sites, along with impacts to water quality and may contribute to global warming through the emission of greenhouse gases (GHG).</p> <p>We would like to kindly suggest that the Ministry of Environment do the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Solid waste management needs to be improved. Improve solid waste management by separating material (e.g glass, aluminum, and plastic, organic and paper) and require by law the recycling of waste from each household, buildings, factories, etc. - Take into account the risks of solid waste and lobby the Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport (MoEYS) to develop curriculum about waste management for educating students from primary school till high school in both public and private schools. - Develop a master plan for solid waste collection sites and carry out proper Environmental Impact Assessment's for each site. - Awareness raising on solid waste management should be integrated into the plans of the government and widely circulated through different methods, such as TV, radio and other IEC materials. MoE should take lead for role model in order to protect environment, such as recycling the waste in offices. - The Ministry of Environment has annually organized the World and National Clean Up Day. Mention should be given if the MoE has ever monitored and evaluated how people's attitudes have changed after the campaign. - MoE, along with other relevant government ministries, should seek to attract private sector investment to develop electricity generation projects in waste areas, in order to help produce electricity while reducing GHG in the atmosphere.

F36	122	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - It is very good that the Ministry has air quality control stations, and we would like to suggest the Ministry of Environment include a table with basic air quality data from the 3 locations and mention how the public can obtain access to the air quality reports. The MoE should regularly collect data from each site. - MoE should build more air quality control stations located in urban areas and around industrial zones, in order to ensure that development activities have not polluted the environment.
36	123	We would also like to kindly suggest that the name of the responsible ministry for monitoring water quality is provided and that they regularly conduct scientific study on the water quality of Cambodia's main rivers (3S Rivers, Mekong River, Tonle Sap lake) which are ecologically rich natural resources. The government should also ensure that impacts to water quality are promptly mitigated and information related to water quality is made public.
36	124	MoE should provide more detailed information on the Master Plan for the 18 protected areas.
26	125	MoE should provide more detailed information about the number of the communities increasing from year by year and what the government response to this increase is.
36	126	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The report should have a Khmer version and be made available to the public through website or other forms of dissemination. • The MoE should kindly provide the name of the reports and research that MoE has conducted to address climate change. • The MoE should play a very important role in coordinating governmental bodies, private sector and civil society to work together on global climate change events, such as COPs in order to raise more concern to developed countries. It would also be useful for the MoE to consider carrying out joint research projects with civil society on climate change.
36	127	<p>We would like MoE to write more detailed information regarding the type of environmental issues disseminated to the public, along with information on how the MoE disseminates the information and the main achievements made.</p> <p>As there have been many events organized by the MoE for the purpose of education and information sharing, through workshops and the national climate change forum, the key events organized by the MoE along with the main achievements should be mentioned.</p>
36	128	The challenges should also include mention on how the Government plans to address the problems. We would like to kindly suggest that the name of the Ministry(s) required to maintain constant watch and dialogue with the Mekong River Commission, and produce regulatory framework to manage Cambodia's eco-system is provided in the NSDP.
35-36	118-128	We would like to suggest that the Ministry of Environment divide the activities according to the tasks and by departments, in order to more easily understood and allow the public to know the responsible departments for the implementation of the projects.
125	421	<p>Some policy priorities mentioned seem to overlap, for instance ii & iii.</p> <p>For point i. MoE should clearly elaborate on how to ensure sustainable use of natural resources and ensure proper</p>

		mitigation measures are in place which are acceptable both to the environment and people, so that development projects will not harm to the environment, natural resources and people.
126	422	<p>We would like to kindly suggest that the Ministry of Environment provide a chart outlining specific information regarding each type of legislation, including a date for when the MoE is expected to get the approval. A very brief explanation about each legislation will make the reader easier to understand.</p> <p>Some legislative plans are not clear and appear to overlap with each other, for example points 9, 10, and 14. Please clearly state the difference between protected area and natural protected areas.</p>
126	423	<p>To ensure sustainable use of natural resource management through review and comments on EIA report with inter-ministry and ensure that the development projects will be not implemented without EIA reports and approval by MoE, we would like to kindly suggest the MoE to consider carrying out the following activities during the next NSDP:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Collaborate with the CDC to collect data of development projects, in order to identify the projects that need to carry out EIA reports. - Review the existing projects, which have been implemented without EIA reports and halt projects until a EIA report has been developed and approved to ensure sustainable development. - Review and revise the Guidelines of EIA report, in consultation and involvement with stakeholders such as line ministries and NGOs, while also including information such as cost and benefits analysis guidelines, detailed public participation processes, and legislation and policy relevant to EIA guidelines. - Set up monitoring tools to evaluate the conformity of the EIA by the development project. The monitoring guidelines should be documented and easy to understand and accessible to all staff of MoE and DoE in the provinces. The costs of all monitoring and necessary equipment should also be incorporated into the EMP of a project. - Strengthen technical capacity of national, city and provincial technical staff on EIA guidelines and EIA monitoring guidelines.
126	424	<p>General comments: the text in English does not fit to the Khmer text. The English text should be improved.</p> <p>Points one and three overlap and are vague in meaning.</p> <p>Point five appears to not be very relevant to this section as it mainly focuses on water pollution. It should be deleted or moved to another section of the NSDP.</p> <p>In general, the MoE should clearly indicate the means or strategies to ensure that the eco-system, water and environment are not polluted and preserved. Clear indicators and tools will allow the MoE to easier evaluate the achievements made.</p>

		<p>Points to be considered by the MoE include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Enhance the standard monitoring of waste water quality standards from industry and other business centers • Explore the appropriate technologies or sound management of reusing the waste water for other purposes, such as for public gardening, for urban/peri-urban agriculture, and etc. • Ensure that water sources used for local consumption are not polluted
126	425	<p>MoE should write more detail to each point on how it plans to achieve each point. For example:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Address climate change: to minimize the impact of climate change by ensuring sufficient resources to implement NAPA with support from other ministries, NGOs, IOs, and development partners. At least 20 projects by NAPA will be completed in 2010 (or 2011). (<i>please note, the figure is just an example</i>) <p>We would like to kindly suggest that the MoE clarify its work on ‘National Climate Change Adaptation’ or ‘National Adaptation Programme of Action to Climate Change (NAPA)’. We would like to kindly recommend that the MoE with other Government ministries, donor partners and civil society to monitor the progress of implementation of the National Adaptation Programme of Action to Climate Change (NAPA) and evaluate the achievements of NAPA using a participatory approach.</p> <p>As the Cambodian NAPA is in line with the RGC’s development objectives as outlined in the “Rectangular Strategy for Growth, Employment, Equity and Efficiency”, the Cambodian Millennium Development Goals, as well as the NSDP 2006-2010, NAPA should be revised based on the evaluation results and recommendations from public consultation processes, and updated in the NSDP 2009-2013, which follows the 4th mandate of the government.</p> <p>We would also like the MoE to kindly consider adding the following points:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Promote gender mainstreaming in natural resources management • Annually assess the effectiveness of Protected Area Management in Cambodia • Continue to assess the biological resources/stock within the protected areas • Draft the participatory guidelines or master plan for sustainable development within protected areas, and endorsed by the RGC • Resubmit the proposal of listing of the Cardamom Mountains as a World Heritage site

127	426	<p>Public awareness is an important part of the MoE's role, but if the MoE can encourage MoEYS and NGOs to raise public awareness on environmental issues, it will be the most effective and efficient way to preserve and protect Cambodia's natural resources and environment for the sustainable development and poverty reduction.</p> <p>We would like to kindly suggest that an awareness plan should be provided, including information of each responsible department and detailed information on what how the MoE will achieve each activity. Mention should also be made to whom within the MoE is responsible for coordinating environmental education and whether a monitoring and evaluation plan has been made for the projects.</p>
127	427	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The NCCC should review the NAPA and validate the project priorities. Moreover there should be direct involvement with the private sector, line ministries and civil society to review and revise the NAPA as needed, in order to ensure that the NAPA responds to climate change in an effective and timely manner, and that it helps the most vulnerable people. • NCCC should continue to find support from interested donors for NAPA implementation • NCCC should promote and encourage climate change initiatives, such as mitigation, adaptation and etc., • NCCC should continue to collaborate with partners and stakeholders to co-organize and coordinate annual National Climate Change Forums • NCCC should engage in regional and global agendas on climate change. • Climate change mainstreaming should be done to all MoE projects • Awareness raising on climate change should occur and be targeted to the public and government ministries. • NCCC should continue to monitor climate change impacts through surveys and research in cooperation with line ministries, private sectors, academics and civil society. • In the plans of the MoE, the concept of climate change should be applied to all projects in order to help address climate change. E.g. how unmanaged waste contributes to the increase of Green House Gases (GHS) and how to mitigate the GHG through the plan of solid waste management. The MoE can also begin to find ways to mitigate the GHG through the EIA reports and encourage the implementation of sustainable Clean Development Mechanism (CDM) projects. All CDM projects should require community approval. • The estimated budget for the implementation of the projects and its indicators should include in this NSDP.
		<p>General suggestions to be considered within the NSDP:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Enforce the rectangular strategy by focusing on accountability, transparency and social responsibility within natural resources management.

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Strengthen the implementation of social and environmental impact assessments before the development of projects, while also improving the quality of future reports. • Encourage all companies to hold meaningful public involvement and consultation in the EIA process. • Mainstream climate change into the MoE's plan and hold awareness raising activities to the public to ensure that the poor and vulnerable people will not suffer from the impacts of climate change. • Mainstream climate change into other ministries' planning. • Develop opportunities for NGOs and communities to cooperate in addressing climate change. • Cooperate with NOGs/IOS to provide training to communities to make them more adaptable to the impacts of climate change.
--	--	--

Contact Information

For more information on this sectoral comment, please contact:

Name organization:	The NGO Forum on Cambodia
Contact person:	Ms. Seng Sothira
Tel:	(855-16) 32 51 99/ 17 67 98 87
Fax:	(855-23) 23 994 063
Email:	sothira@ngoforum.org.kh
Website:	www.ngoforum.org.kh
Name organization:	Stockholm Environment Institute (SEI)
Contact person:	Mr. Sam Chanthy
Tel:	011 931 982 or 017 560 601
Email:	chanthy.sam@sei.se or samchanthy@gmail.com
Website:	www.sei.se
Name organization:	Khmer National Community Economic Development
Contact person:	Mr. Pen Sokhon
Tel:	(855-53) 636 3015/ 16 958 602
Fax:	
Email:	bnsd.net_btb@yahoo.com
Website:	
Name organization:	WWF
Contact person:	Mr. Kim Sangha
Tel:	(855)-12 629 221.
Email:	Sangha.Kim@wwfgreatermekong.org

12. Aid Effectiveness

Para Number	NGO Comment
<u>373</u>	<p><i>“The Royal Government is committed to implement “the Accra Agenda for Action” which represents the consensus at the third High Level Forum on Enhanced Effectiveness of Official Development Assistance (ODA) in order to strengthen national ownership and leadership, and partnership and transparency with all development partners as well as to enhance result-based management (.....)”</i></p> <p>Suggestion:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The government should indicate his commitment and achievement that has been done to enable the National Assembly and citizens in the monitoring process of development cooperation mechanisms/ platforms and its accountability for development result. • Add in bracket (...): Its mutual accountability for the development result to the National Assembly and its citizens
<u>378</u>	<p><i>“The Government-Development Partner Coordination Committee (GDCC) and Technical Working Group (TWG) mechanisms will continue to provide the principal modes of dialogue between the Royal Government and its development partners. Their performance and structure will be monitored and reviewed to ensure that the partnerships between the Royal Government and its development partners are based on strengthened <u>government ownership</u> and accountability for development results”.</i></p> <p>Comment</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • GDCC and TWG mechanism will continue to provide the platforms for policy dialogue between the Royal Government, its development partners and CSOs. Their performance and structure will be monitored and reviewed to ensure that the partnership between the Royal Government, its development partners and CSOs are based to strengthen country ownership and accountability for development results.
<u>381</u>	<p><i>‘Partnerships are meaningful when the TWGs are not only the forum for discussion on issues but also where measures to address these issues are agreed and implementation jointly monitored by <u>the Government and development partners</u> (....). The TWG mechanism will be strengthened to support the monitoring of the implementation of development cooperation activities in the sector or area that they support’</i></p> <p>Suggestion to add in (...):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • With the same status quo engagement of CSOs and NGOs in the 19 TWGs

<p>382</p> <p><i>“....The Cambodia ODA Database, which is the Royal Government's information platform on development cooperation activities, will be customized to support the work related to planning and budgeting.....”</i></p> <p>Suggestion to rephrase:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Cambodia ODA database will provide timely updated, accurate and adequate aid-financing projects through a customized, systematic and well-integrated link with PIP for planning and budgeting.
<p>386</p> <p><i>“The Royal Government appreciates the active participation in national development processes of civil society organizations that are genuinely willing to contribute in both financial and operational resources. The Government considers the resources and expertise brought in by CSOs as an important input in the policy processes to reach the desirable development results. The Royal Government will continue to ensure rigorous participation of CSOs in the dialogue mechanisms (...).”</i></p> <p>Suggestion:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Add in the bracket (.....): through the recognition of CSOs/NGOs as their legitimate stakeholders, well-informed date of related policy forums, publicly available updated development result information, proper time span for sending inputs/comments in each stage of policy and budging formulation, monitoring and execution, and space for public consultation.

Contact Information:

For more information on this sectoral comment, please contact:

The NGO Forum on Cambodia
 Mr. Chea Kimsong, Development Issues Programme Manager
 TEL: (+855) 23 214 429 Ext. N° 107
 Fax: (+855) 23 994 063
 Email: kimsong@ngoforum.org.kh
 Website: www.ngoforum.org.kh

13. Inclusion of disability

1. Introduction

The Cambodian Disabled People's Organization, Disability Action Council and Handicap International on behalf of the NSDP Inclusive committee and **disability sector** would like to insist that more efforts are made by government to ensure the achievement of the **Cambodian Millennium Development Goals** in accordance with the Nairobi Conference on Victim Assistance, the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (UNCRPD), the law on protection and promotion of the rights of persons with disabilities (PPRPD) and National Plan of Action (NPA) that enacted by the Royal Government of Cambodia (RGC) in recent year.

To ensure that persons with disabilities are benefiting from and contributing to poverty reduction strategies, all development programs could better address the poverty situation of all Cambodian citizens through a more coherent integration of disability in monitoring and strategies and integrating disability references and indicators as a cross-cutting issue into the NSDP Update (2009- 2013) and others sectoral plans/ policies and all development programs.

I. Specific Disability Sector Comment on the first draft NSDP Update 2009-2013

Page*	Para-number**	Original Text from the first draft NSDP Update 2009-2013	NGO Comment
18	53	<p>The long-term development objective of the Royal Government's decentralization and de-concentration reform program is to achieve broad-based and sustainable development and strengthen vibrant local economic foundations so that every citizen has equal opportunity to participate in local development, effective environment and natural resource management and delivery of quality public services to meet the needs of citizen and poverty reduction by focusing on vulnerable groups, indigenous minorities, women and children.</p> <p>The Royal Government believes that establishing and promoting democratic development at provincial/municipal, district/ Khan and commune/ Sangkat levels can best achieve the expansion of democratic governance. Reforms of management systems of provincial/municipal, district/khan and commune /sangkat administrations have the following two strategic goals: (i) to strengthen and expand local democracy; and (ii) to promote local development and to reduce poverty.³</p>	<p>The long-term development objective of the Royal Government's decentralization and de-concentration reform program is to achieve broad-based and sustainable development and strengthen vibrant local economic foundations so that every citizen has equal opportunity to participate in local development, effective environment and natural resource management and delivery of quality public services to meet the needs of citizen and poverty reduction by focusing on vulnerable groups, indigenous minorities, disabled people, women and children.</p> <p>The Royal Government believes that establishing and promoting democratic development at provincial/municipal, district/Khan and commune/ Sangkat levels can best achieve the expansion of democratic governance. Reforms of management systems of provincial/municipal, district/khan and commune / sangkat administrations have the following two strategic goals: (i) to strengthen and expand local democracy; and (ii) to promote local development and to reduce poverty.³</p>
39/40	143, 144, 145	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Railways, Ports and Airports 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ensure accessibility for persons with disabilities (PPRPD)
53	193	<p>The MoSAVY, also provides services to homeless and destitute people, emergency relief to people effected by natural and other disasters, victims of sex trafficking and inter-country human trafficking, protecting the four basic rights of children, promoting family values, and caring for orphan infants, orphan children, disable children, and children with HIV/AIDS.</p>	<p>The MoSAVY, also provides services to homeless and destitute people, emergency relief to people effected by natural and other disasters, victims of sex trafficking and inter-country human trafficking, protecting the four basic rights of children, promoting and protection the rights of persons with disabilities, promoting family values, and caring for orphan infants, orphan children disabled children and children with HIV/AIDS.</p>
56	202	The priority policies in the ESP 2006-2010 are focused	The priority policies in the ESP 2006-2010 are focused on

		<p>on three areas: (i) ensuring equitable access to education; (ii) improving quality and efficiency of the education services; and (iii) strengthening institutional development and capacity building for decentralization. Significant progress has been made to achieve the major priorities of ESP 2006-2010, especially in ensuring entry of 6 years old to primary schools and reducing parental cost barriers at all schools and all levels nationwide. The implementation of Child Friendly School (CFS), curriculum and standard assessment has contributed to improving education quality and efficiency. Good progress has been made especially on increasing the number of primary schools and lower secondary schools, increasing the number of students enrolled in secondary schools, and increasing adult literacy rate (15-24). However, it is recognized that there are still gaps that require more intensive efforts to implement the strategies successfully, especially those related to Early Childhood Education, reducing repetition and drop out rates, facility development and higher education in particular for <u>students from poor families and remote areas</u>. Table 2 shows the latest data for the education sector.</p>	<p>three areas: (i) ensuring equitable access to education; (ii) improving quality and efficiency of the education services; and (iii) strengthening institutional development and capacity building for decentralization. Significant progress has been made to achieve the major priorities of ESP 2006-2010, especially in ensuring entry of 6 years old to primary schools and reducing parental cost barriers at all schools and all levels nationwide. The implementation of Child Friendly School (CFS), curriculum and standard assessment has contributed to improving education quality and efficiency. Good progress has been made especially on increasing the number of primary schools and lower secondary schools, increasing the number of students enrolled in secondary schools, and increasing adult literacy rate (15-24). However, it is recognized that there are still gaps that require more intensive efforts to implement the strategies successfully, especially those related to Early Childhood Education, reducing repetition and drop out rates, facility development and higher education in particular for <u>students from poor families students with disabilities and from remote areas</u>. Table 2 shows the latest data for the education sector.</p>
141	468	<p>To implement RGC's priority policies, the Ministry of Information will:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Expand coverage and improve <u>the quality and effectiveness of the national media to provide services to 95 percent of the population across the country</u>, to the region and other continents, including North America. • Continue construction of new provincial radio and television stations and improvement of their capacity to enable them to rely on live major events at the national level, and to be able to produce and broadcast programs to more areas, 	<p>To implement RGC's priority policies, the Ministry of Information will:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Expand coverage and improve <u>the quality, accessibility and effectiveness of the national media to provide services to 95 percent of the population including deaf and blind people across the country</u>, to the region and other continents, including North America. • Continue construction of new provincial radio and television stations and improvement of their capacity to enable them to rely on live major events at the national level, and to be able to

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • especially on issues facing women and children. • Build institutional and human resources capacity, with an emphasis to increase the number of female staff, to improve delivery of services to the public and to effectively interact and cooperate within ASEAN, in the region and with development partners. • Enforce the Press Law in order to enhance the rule of law, and freedom of the press, of expression and of publications. • Study, research and draft legal instruments in order to effectively regulate the media businesses and to support the development of information and audio filed and information technology. • Continue encouraging and opening up the participation of the public sector, civil society groups, and non-governmental organizations, and give priority to women to play their role in the information and audio field. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • produce and broadcast programs to more areas, especially on issues facing women and children. • Build institutional and human resources capacity, with an emphasis to increase the number of female staff, to improve delivery of services to the public and to effectively interact and cooperate within ASEAN, in the region and with development partners. • Enforce the Press Law in order to enhance the rule of law, and freedom of the press, of expression and of publications. • Study, research and draft legal instruments in order to effectively regulate the media businesses and to support the development of information and audio filed and information technology. • Continue encouraging and opening up the participation of the public sector, civil society groups, and non-governmental organizations, and give priority to women to play their role in the information and audio field.
147	488	<p>To implement RGC's priority policies, the Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training (MLVT) will take actions to:</p> <p>iv. Expand technical and vocation training, in particular in rural areas, by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Carrying out a comprehensive analysis of technical and vocational training required to meet the needs of employers in the urban areas as well as to support the development of rural communities. • Develop national qualifications, national competency standards, testing, and accreditation of technical and vocational training courses and programs. • Expand the scope and number of technical and 	<p>To implement RGC's priority policies, the Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training (MLVT) will take actions to:</p> <p>iv. Expand technical and vocation training, in particular in rural areas, by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Carrying out a comprehensive analysis of technical and vocational training required to meet the needs of employers in the urban areas as well as to support the development of rural communities. • Develop national qualifications, national competency standards, testing, and accreditation of technical and vocational training courses and programs. • Expand the scope and number of technical and

		<p>vocational training institutes across the country and actively promote the participation of the private sector in providing the required technical and vocational training.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <u>Ensure gender equity in access to technical and vocational training opportunities.</u> 	<p>vocational training institutes across the country and actively promote the participation of the private sector in providing the required technical and vocational training.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <u>Ensure gender and disability equity in access to technical and vocational training opportunities.</u>
155	512	<p>In the Fourth Legislature, the Royal Government will continue to implement the <i>Education Strategic Plan</i>, putting emphasis on ensuring that all Cambodian children and youth should have equal opportunity for access to basic education, both formal and informal, without discrimination <u>on grounds of race, skin colour, gender, languages, religion, political affiliations of parents, place of birth and social status</u>. Equally, the implementation of the Strategic Plan is linked to imparting a culture of peace, respect for human rights and dignity, respect for the principles of freedom, democracy and justice, and instilling a culture against violence, drug use, child and women trafficking and social discrimination.</p>	<p>In the Fourth Legislature, the Royal Government will continue to implement the <i>Education Strategic Plan</i>, putting emphasis on ensuring that all Cambodian children and youth should have equal opportunity for access to basic education, both formal and informal, without discrimination <u>on grounds of race, skin colour, gender, disability, languages, religion, political affiliations of parents, place of birth and social status</u>. Equally, the implementation of the Strategic Plan is linked to imparting a culture of peace, respect for human rights and dignity, respect for the principles of freedom, democracy and justice, and instilling a culture against violence, drug use, child and women trafficking and social discrimination.</p>
160	522	<p>The Royal Government recognizes that healthy people constitute the key basis for human resource development and sustainable socio-economic progress. The Royal Government has placed emphasis on enhancing the general well-being of <u>all citizens, particularly the poor, women and children</u>. To ensure systematic development of health services delivery to the population, RGC adopted a Sector Wide Management (SwiM) approach and developed its first Health Sector Strategic Plan (HSP) for 2003-2007. It has been implemented in close cooperation with external development partners (EDPs) who were engaged in this sector. A new HSP for 2008-2015 has been developed.</p>	<p>The Royal Government recognizes that healthy people constitute the key basis for human resource development and sustainable socio-economic progress. The Royal Government has placed emphasis on enhancing the general well-being of <u>all citizens, particularly the poor, disabled, women and children</u>. To ensure systematic development of health services delivery to the population, RGC adopted a Sector Wide Management (SwiM) approach and developed its first Health Sector Strategic Plan (HSP) for 2003-2007. It has been implemented in close cooperation with external development partners (EDPs) who were engaged in this sector. A new HSP for 2008-2015 has been developed. It is now being</p>

		<p>It is now being implemented in close cooperation with all EDPs; as well as, work on implementing the Minimum Package of Activities (MPA) is progressing well. Health is one of the four priority sector for PAP, which ensures adequate allocation and timely releases of budgetary funds both for current and capital expenditures. In the third legislature, the current budget for health doubled, accounting for about 10 per cent of the total current budget in 2007.</p>	<p>implemented in close cooperation with all EDPs; as well as, work on implementing the Minimum Package of Activities (MPA) is progressing well. Health is one of the four priority sector for PAP, which ensures adequate allocation and timely releases of budgetary funds both for current and capital expenditures. In the third legislature, the current budget for health doubled, accounting for about 10 per cent of the total current budget in 2007.</p>
161	526	<p>The implementation of priority policies for health sector over the next five years will be guided by the strategic framework outlined in the Health Strategic Plan 2008-2015 (HSP2), RGC's policy on public services delivery, the policy framework for decentralization and de-concentration, and national budget strategic framework. The strategic priorities for the health sector fall into two broad interrelated areas that the Ministry of Health and all stakeholders will pay particular attention to. These two areas are: population health problems and essential services, and challenges in relation to functional areas of the health system on both the "supply-side" and the "demand-side". The building blocks of the HSP2 strategic framework are the following three main health programs of the MoH:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Reproductive, Maternal, New Born and Child Health. ii. Communicable Diseases. <u>iii. Non communicable Diseases and other health problems.</u> 	<p>The implementation of priority policies for health sector over the next five years will be guided by the strategic framework outlined in the Health Strategic Plan 2008-2015 (HSP2), RGC's policy on public services delivery, the policy framework for decentralization and de-concentration, and national budget strategic framework. The strategic priorities for the health sector fall into two broad interrelated areas that the Ministry of Health and all stakeholders will pay particular attention to. These two areas are: population health problems and essential services, and challenges in relation to functional areas of the health system on both the "supply-side" and the "demand-side". The building blocks of the HSP2 strategic framework are the following three main health programs of the MoH:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Reproductive, Maternal, New Born and Child Health. ii. Communicable Diseases. <u>iii. Non communicable Diseases and other health problems such as related to physical, mental, intellectual, speech, hearing and visual impairments.</u>
162	527	<p>In each of these three program areas the MoH will focus on implementing the following five cross-cutting health strategies that include both "supply-side" and "demand side" measures:</p>	<p>In each of these three program areas the MoH will focus on implementing the following five cross-cutting health strategies that include both "supply-side" and "demand side" measures:</p>

		<p>i. Health Service Delivery: Actions will be taken to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Expand coverage of the Minimum Packages of Activity (MPA) and the Complimentary Packages of Activity (CPA) based on Health Coverage Plan with a focus on meeting client needs. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <u>Strengthen health Service delivery support systems in an integrated manner.</u> • <u>Target public health services provision and public health interventions according to need.</u> • Develop and apply consistent standards of quality across the entire health sector (public, private and non-profit). • Develop contracting models as part of a comprehensive approach to health services delivery. 	<p>i. Health Service Delivery: Actions will be taken to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Expand coverage of the Minimum Packages of Activity (MPA) and the Complimentary Packages of Activity (CPA) based on Health Coverage Plan with a focus on meeting client needs. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <u>Strengthen health Service delivery support systems in an integrated manner, including persons with disabilities (PWDs).</u> • <u>Target public health services provision and public health interventions according to needs of the public including persons with disabilities.</u> • Develop and apply consistent standards of quality across the entire health sector (public, private and non-profit). • Develop contracting models as part of a comprehensive approach to health services delivery.
162	527	<p>iv. Health Information System: Actions will be taken to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Increase the availability of accurate, timely, and complete health data of high quality from public and private sources, together with enhanced coordination, and resources for the Health Information System (HIS). <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <u>Improve data sharing, management, analysis, dissemination and use across all levels of the health system, including population and socio-demographic data.</u> • Improve the national disease surveillance system, public facility patient medical record system, and strengthen the case reporting, monitoring and response to non communicable diseases. • <u>Expand participation in the national HIS by the private sector, and facilitate data use for</u> 	<p>iv. Health Information System: Actions will be taken to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Increase the availability of accurate, timely, and complete health data of high quality from public and private sources, together with enhanced coordination, and resources for the Health Information System (HIS). <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <u>Improve data sharing for the public especially the deaf and blind people, management, analysis, dissemination and use across all levels of the health system, including population and socio-demographic data.</u> • Improve the national disease surveillance system, public facility patient medical record system, and strengthen the case reporting, monitoring and response to non communicable diseases. • <u>Expand participation in the national HIS by the private sector including health and disability-</u>

		<u>planning, resource allocation and management of human resources, infrastructure, and supplies.</u>	<u>related organizations, and facilitate data use for planning, resource allocation and management of human resources, infrastructure, and supplies.</u>
163	529	<p>To implement the priority policies of the RGC for the health sector, the day-to-day activities of health managers and staff of the MoH at all levels will be guided by the following five working principles:</p> <p>i. Ensure social health protection, especially for the poor and vulnerable groups.</p> <p>ii. Maintain a client focused approach to health services delivery.</p> <p>iii. Follow an integrated approach to high quality health care delivery and public health interventions.</p> <p>iv. Make human resources management as the cornerstone for health system.</p> <p>v. Ensure good governance and accountability.</p>	<p>To implement the priority policies of the RGC for the health sector, the day-to-day activities of health managers and staff of the MoH at all levels will be guided by the following five working principles:</p> <p>i. Ensure social health protection, especially for the poor, vulnerable groups and persons with disabilities.</p> <p>ii. Maintain a client focused approach to health services delivery.</p> <p>iii. Follow an integrated approach to high quality health care delivery and public health interventions.</p> <p>iv. Make human resources management as the cornerstone for health system.</p> <p>v. Ensure good governance and accountability.</p>
168	542	<p>In the strategic area Promotion of women's participation in decision making in the public and political sector, the MOWA in cooperation with relevant stakeholders will take the following actions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increase the number of active women representatives in decision making in government institutions and at all sub national levels through lobbying of political parties and relevant institutions to increase the proportion of women standing for elections and putting their candidacy higher up in the list for senate, parliamentary and sub national councils; encourage political dialogue and develop strategies and advocacy for affirmative action and set quotas for women at all levels; raising public awareness of the importance of women's 	<p>In the strategic area Promotion of women's participation including women with disabilities in decision making in the public and political sector, the MOWA in cooperation with relevant stakeholders will take the following actions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increase the number of active women representatives including women with disabilities in decision making in government institutions and at all sub national levels through lobbying of political parties and relevant institutions to increase the proportion of women standing for elections and putting their candidacy higher up in the list for senate, parliamentary and sub national councils; encourage political dialogue and develop strategies and advocacy for affirmative action and set quotas for women at all

		<p>participation at the senior level as lower house representative, provincial, municipal, district and Khan board of governors and commune councilor; and capacity development for elected and appointed women by the public at national and sub national levels including female candidates standing for commune council elections 2012 and the next national elections.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The promotion of <u>women's participation</u> in decision making in the public sector at all levels by pushing for the implementation of policies and procedures for promotion and recruitment of government officials in response to gender equality; cooperating with the Royal School of Administration in setting up gender responsive curriculum and increasing the number of female students – Cooperating with the women civil servant association and relevant players in improving the effectiveness of performance and rights protection, and the well being of women civil servants; capacity building and skills at Leadership and Management as well as other related skills for women leaders. 	<p>levels; raising public awareness of the importance of women's participation at the senior level as lower house representative, provincial, municipal, district and Khan board of governors and commune councilor; and capacity development for elected and appointed women by the public at national and sub national levels including female candidates standing for commune council elections 2012 and the next national elections.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The promotion of <u>women's participation including women with disabilities</u> in decision making in the public sector at all levels by pushing for the implementation of policies and procedures for promotion and recruitment of government officials in response to gender equality; cooperating with the Royal School of Administration in setting up gender responsive curriculum and increasing the number of female students – Cooperating with the women civil servant association and relevant players in improving the effectiveness of performance and rights protection, and the well being of women civil servants; capacity building and skills at Leadership and Management as well as other related skills for women leaders.
169	543	<p>“Gender equality and the empowerment of women” is a development goal in its own right of which the Ministry of Women’s Affairs has a clear mandate to advocate and monitor progress, but the mechanisms and methodologies for achieving this development goal, i.e. through “gender mainstreaming” per definition cross-cut all sectors and policies. This follows the NSDP 2006-2010 and the Rectangular Strategy Phase II (2009-2013), which requires each sector to promote gender equality within its mandate.</p>	<p>“Gender equality and the empowerment of women” is a development goal in its own right of which the Ministry of Women’s Affairs has a clear mandate to advocate and monitor progress, but the mechanisms and methodologies for achieving this development goal, i.e. through “gender mainstreaming” per definition cross-cut all sectors and policies. This follows the NSDP 2006-2010 and the Rectangular Strategy Phase II (2009-2013), which requires each sector to promote gender equality within its mandate.</p>

		<p><i>i. Gender mainstreaming in national policies and the statistical system</i> by focusing mainly on gender mainstreaming in the process of developing, monitoring and evaluation of national policies and sectoral polices; strengthening and scaling up the mechanisms of gender mainstreaming at the national and sub national levels; capacity development on gender mainstreaming for relevant government institutions at the national and sub national levels; advocating and lobbying for integrating gender issues in the process of sectoral planning, budgeting and reporting; improving preparation and implementation of sector gender mainstreaming plans at the national and sub national level; and gender mainstreaming in the national statistical system.</p>	<p><i>i. Gender mainstreaming including women with disabilities in national policies and the statistical system</i> by focusing mainly on gender mainstreaming in the process of developing, monitoring and evaluation of national policies and sectoral polices; strengthening and scaling up the mechanisms of gender mainstreaming at the national and sub national levels; capacity development on gender mainstreaming for relevant government institutions at the national and sub national levels; advocating and lobbying for integrating gender issues in the process of sectoral planning, budgeting and reporting; improving preparation and implementation of sector gender mainstreaming plans at the national and sub national level; and gender mainstreaming in the national statistical system.</p>
182	Table 26	<p>Improvements in Education (*)</p> <p>16* Net Enrolment: Primary Schools -- Total; Boys; Girls --% 91.9; 93.0; 90.7 100 100</p> <p>17* Net Enrolment: Lower Sec. Schools --Total; Boys; Girls -- % 26.1; 27.1; 24.8 75 100</p> <p>18* Survival rate % : 1-6: 53.1 100 100</p> <p>19* Survival rate % : 1-9: 30.18 76 100</p> <p>20* 6-14 years out of school (%) 18.7 11 0</p>	<p>The Indicator of Education Sector in the NSDP update (2009-2013) should be linked to disability issues already stated in the “Millennium Development Goals: Situation of persons with disabilities based on available global data”, which are as the following mentioned:</p> <p>Goal 2. Achieve universal primary education</p> <p>2.1 Net enrolment ratio of children with disabilities in primary education</p> <p>2.2 Proportion of pupils with disabilities starting grade 1 who reach the last grade in primary school</p> <p>2.3 Literacy rate of 15- to 24-year-olds with disabilities, women and men</p>
182	Table 26	<p>Improvements in Health (*)</p> <p>7* Infant Mortality Rate per 1,000 live births 66 60 50</p> <p>8* > 5 Mortality Rate per 1,000 live births 82 75 65</p> <p>9* Maternal Mortality per 100,000 live births N/A 243 140</p> <p>10* Births attended by skilled health personnel -- % N/A 70 80</p> <p>11* HIV/AIDS prevalence, % of adults 15-49 1.9 1.9 1.8</p>	<p>The Indicator of Health Sector in the new NSDP (2009-2013) should be linked to disability issues already stated in the “Millennium Development Goals: Situation of persons with disabilities based on available global data”, which are as the following mentioned:</p> <p>Goal 4. Reduce child mortality</p> <p>4.1. Under-five mortality rate for all children with disabilities</p>

	<p>12* Malaria Cases - fatality % 0.36 0.2 0.1 13* TB smear positive cases, per 100,000 N/A 214 135 14* Married women using modern birth spacing methods (%) 20.1 44 60 15 % of health facilities providing RH services 33 45 70</p>	<p>4.2. Infant mortality rate for all infants born with disabilities 4.3. Proportion of one-year-old children with disabilities immunized against measles</p> <p>Goal 5. Improve maternal health</p> <p>5.1. Maternal mortality rate for women with disabilities 5.2. Proportion of births among women with disabilities attended by skilled health personnel 5.3. Contraceptive prevalence rate among women with disabilities 5.4. Adolescent birth rate among young women with disabilities 5.5. Antenatal care coverage (at least one visit and at least four visits) for all women with disabilities who are pregnant 5.6. Unmet need for family planning among women with disabilities</p> <p>Goal 6. Combat HIV/AIDS, malaria and other diseases</p> <p>6.1. HIV prevalence among pregnant women with disabilities aged 15 to 24 6.2. Contraceptive use at last high-risk behaviour among women and men with disabilities 6.3. Percentage of population with disabilities aged 15 to 24 with comprehensive correct knowledge of HIV/AIDS 6.4. Ratio of school attendance of orphans with disabilities to school attendance compared both with non-disabled orphans and non-orphans aged 10-14 6.5. Proportion of population with disabilities with advanced HIV infection with access to antiretroviral drugs 6.6. Incidence and death rates associated with malaria among individuals with disabilities compared with the non-disabled population</p>
--	---	---

			<p>6.7. Proportion of children with disabilities under five sleeping under insecticide-treated bed nets compared with non-disabled children</p> <p>6.8. Proportion of children with disabilities under five with fever who are treated with appropriate anti-malarial drugs</p> <p>6.9. Incidence, prevalence and death rates associated with tuberculosis among individuals with disabilities compared with the non-disabled population</p> <p>6.10. Proportion of tuberculosis cases among persons with disabilities detected and cured under directly observed treatment short course</p>
182	<p>Table 26</p> <p>Accelerate Industrial Growth & Employment</p> <p>37 Annual Growth in manufacturing - constant prices (%) 10.2 7.2</p> <p>38* Working children aged 5-17 years -- % 22.3 10.6</p> <p>8</p>	<p>The Indicator of Industrial Growth and Employment Sector in the new NSDP (2009-2013) should be linked to disability issues already stated in the "Millennium Development Goals: Situation of persons with disabilities based on available global data", which are as the following mentioned:</p> <p>Goal 1. Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Proportion of population with disabilities below \$1 per day • Poverty gap ratio between persons with disabilities and non-disabled • Proportion of persons with disabilities within the poorest quintile in national consumption • Growth rate of GDP per person with disabilities employed • Employment-to-population ratio for persons with disabilities • Proportion of employed persons with disabilities living below \$1 per day • Proportion of own-account and contributing family workers with disability in total employment • Prevalence of underweight children with disability 	

			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • under five years of age • Proportion of population with disabilities below minimum level of dietary energy consumption
--	--	--	---

* The page number refers to the page-number of the first draft NSDP Update 2009-2013.

* The para-number refers to the paragraph-number of the first draft NSDP Update 2009-2013.

Contact Information

For more information on this sectoral comment, please contact:

NSDP Inclusive Committee

Members of the NSDP Inclusive Committee: Action on Disability and Development (ADD), The Association of the Blind in Cambodia (ABC), Cambodian Disabled People's Organization (CDPO), Deaf Development Program (DDP), Disability Action Council (DAC), Handicap International French Section (HI F) and National Centre of Disabled Persons (NCDP)

Contact organizations: **Handicap International, French section, CDPO and DAC**

Contact persons: **Mr. Ung Sophea**, Project Manager (HI F); **Mr. Kham Piseth**, Program Manager (CDPO);

Mr. Vorn Samphors, Deputy Executive Director DAC;

Tel: (023) 214 504/ 011 97 58 67 (HI F); 012 542 873 (CDPO), 012 702 279 (DAC)

Email: pm-prsp@hicambodia.org; pm@cdpo.org; samphors@dac.org.kh

14. Public Financial Reform and Budget Allocation

i) On paragraph 566 of the NSDP Update

NGO Forum welcomes the significant attention¹ that is given in the current draft of the NSDP Update on the need to further improve linking Government planning and budgeting (financed by domestic and development partner resources). Whereas paragraph 566 rightly emphasizes the role of the Task Force² we would like to request to MEF and other institutions in the Task Force to provide an elaboration on when the taskforce expects to finalize its tasks as outlined in paragraph 566 in the next version of the NSDP Update 2009-2013.

ii) On paragraph 552 of the NSDP Update

Related to the linking of planning and budgeting, it is observed that there is an absence of a capital costing by ministries of the NSDP Update 2009-2013. Although a costing of the NSDP Update was announced in Government's Circular on the Preparation of the NSDP Update (page 6, annex II, B5), the current draft of the NSDP Update mentions in paragraph 552 (page 173) that "*not many ministries/agencies were able to provide the information that is needed...*". The NGO Forum on Cambodia would like to request to the Ministry of Planning and the Ministry of Economy and Finance that the next version of the NSDP Update includes:

- An elaboration of what the Royal Government, supported by its development partners, can do to ensure that "*the data required for development planning and public investment resources with relevance to development priorities for poverty reduction are readily available in the costing chapter of the NSDP Update*".
- A reference that the costing refers to both recurrent and capital budgets of the line ministries in order to ensure consistency between the NSDP Update, the National Budget, and the PIP.

iii) On Table 14 of the NSDP Update

Finally we would like to express our genuine appreciation for the increased amount of budget information included in the NSDP Update (Table 14 '*Indicative recurrent budget expenditure by ministry / agency 2008-2013*'). Concerning the table we would like to make the following suggestions for your consideration:

1. The estimated expenditures in 2009 should be replaced with actual expenditure in the next and final version of the NSDP Update;
2. Replace the estimates for 2010 budget allocations by actual allocations in the 2010 Budget Law;

¹ See especially paragraphs 302, 315, 382, 551, 566 of the draft NSDP Update (2009-2013). In the NSDP Mid Term Review of 2008 (para 1.10) this issue was also clearly recognized as a challenge.

² Consisting of the Ministry of Economy and Finance, Council for the Development of Cambodia, the Supreme National Economic Council and chaired by the Ministry of Planning

3. On the actual allocations included in table 14 of the draft NSDP Update 2009-2013:

- Add the missing four institutions under the category of “General Administration”: Royal Palace, National Assembly, Senate and Constitutional Council.
- Although we welcome the decrease in General Administration budgets and the fact that the Ministry of Justice is excluded from this decrease; the National Audit Authority should be considered to be excluded from this overall decrease in allocations for General Administration given its important role in further contributing to improving Cambodia’s good governance through external audit on all public institutions (and the relative small size of its budget).
- Compared to sectors that are of crucially important for continued poverty reduction and economic growth, allocations to national defense and security budgets are high. We propose that the level of these increases is reduced and that these reductions are allocated to the Ministry of Agriculture, Fishery and Forestry, Ministry of Rural and Development, and Ministry of Water Resource and Methodology. Although these three ministries receive some priority in the proposed allocations, these need to be further increased given the small size of their budgets and the large need for development of the rural areas (91% of poor live in rural areas and 70% of Cambodian people are employed in agriculture).

Contact Information

For more information on the issues raised in this sectoral comments, please contact:

The NGO Forum on Cambodia
Mr. Chea Kimsong, Development Issue Programme Manager
TEL: (+855) 23 214 429 Ext. N° 107
Fax: 023 214 429
Email: kimsong@ngoforum.org.kh

15. Inclusion of the National Audit Authority's Achievement, Challenges, Strategic Plan

It was noted that the important role of the National Audit Authority was not mentioned in the NSDP Update 2009-2013 unlike the previous version of the National Strategic Development Plan (2006-2010) which makes reference to your institution in the section on good governance in paragraph 2.14, page 15: "*The government has strengthened the National Audit Authority (NAA) and has expanded the scope of implementation of the Public Procurement Sub-Decree to all ministries and agencies...*"³

The NGO Forum on Cambodia would like to encourage and express the genuine support to the National Audit Authority for raising the achievement, role, and strategic plan of the National Audit Authority is critical in realizing further improvements in good Governance. In our view, the sufficient achievement and challenges of NAA in contribution of strengthening good governance, transparency and accountability should included in the NSDP Update 2009-2013 as the following key elements:

1. In chapter two of the first draft NSDP update 2009-2013 on achievements and challenges of implementation in NSDP 2006-2010, the National Audit Authority could highlight the publication of the 2006 Audit Report in October 2009.
2. In chapter four of this draft on key policy priorities and actions, a number of priorities from the 2007-2011 Strategic Development Plan could be included while reference is made to the full plan for more details.

NGO Forum on Cambodia would like to take this opportunity to express our genuine support for the work of the National Audit Authority and also Ministry of Planning to make the fully development plan and have a real mechanism to ensure the strengthening of good governance through ensuring the financial management system which has more transparency and accountability in responding the need of public service for the poor and vulnerable group.

Contact Information

For more information on the issues raised in this sectoral comments, please contact:

The NGO Forum on Cambodia
Mr. Chea Kimsong, Development Issue Programme Manager
TEL: (+855) 23 214 429 Ext. N° 107
Fax: 023 214 429
Email: kimsong@ngoforum.org.kh

³ Royal Government of Cambodia (2006), National Strategic Development Plan 2006-2010

16. Inclusion Disaster Risk Reduction

Strategic progress in mainstreaming DRR in Cambodia: The Royal Government of Cambodia (RGC) is one of the 168 signatory nations to the Hyogo Framework for Action (HFA) whose implementation spans 2005-2015 and provides a firm guideline on the understanding and practice of disaster management around the world. At the follow-up Beijing Action for Disaster Reduction in Asia conference in 2005, it was resolved that countries in Asia would develop national action plans for Disaster Risk Reduction (DRR) to comply with the principle of HFA. The Cambodia National Committee for Disaster Management (NCDM) and the Ministry of Planning (MOP) subsequently spearheaded the formulation of a "Strategic National Action Plan" (SNAP) for the DRR 2008-2013. The RGC has also made firm commitments to implement and monitor progress in this regard.

Beside establishing the National Committee for Disaster Management (NCDM), the RGC also established a Risk Management Mechanism (RMM) in 2002. These mechanisms have structures at all levels of governance from the National to sub-national level. The respective structures beside the NCDM are Provincial Committee for Disaster Management (PCDM), District Committee for Disaster Management (DCDM), and Commune Committee for Disaster Management (CCDM). The RGC has also developed royal decree/sub-decree/policies to cope with Disaster Risk Reduction (DRR) such as:

- Royal decree on establishment of the National Committee for Disaster Management on 16 February 2002.
- Sub-decree on preparation and implementation of National Committee for Disaster Management (national and local level) on 9 April 2002.
- Participated in Hyogo Framework 2005-2015 [HFA (2005-2015 action)], 2005.
- Decision on establishment of inter-institutions technical working group for developing Strategic National Action for Disaster Reduction 2008-2013, on 25 October 2007.
- Strategic National Action for Disaster Reduction (SNAP) 2008-2013, and
- Law on disaster risk management (drafting in progress)

Most recently, unpredictable disasters in Cambodia⁴ have significantly increased in impact thus affecting greater number of people and causing huge losses and damage. For example Typhoon Ketsana that hit Cambodia in late September 2009 not only resulted in human deaths and damage to crops and livestock, but also resulted in huge financial losses due to huge damage to the infrastructures including roads, bridges, drinking water and sanitation systems.

Justification for mainstreaming DRR into the NSDP: For the country to avoid losses due to disasters and be better prepared with institutions and resources there is an urgent need to mainstream DRR into all spheres of development. The mainstreaming of DRR requires a clear and firm

⁴ SNAP 2008-2013, page 4

policy commitment in order for its practical application to be realized at various levels. The NSDP is a pillar national document that needs to carry the weight and emphasis of DRR in all sectors.

Beside the global commitment that Cambodia has made in with respect to implementing DRR, the integration of DRR into the NSDP:

- will safeguard the gains made in poverty reduction
- is low cost investment with high return rates
- leads to social stability/cohesion
- is one way of tackling issues of Climate Change
- leads to big cumulative gains for Cambodia which though does not suffer big single disasters has multiple and repeated shocks that need tackling from all fronts and at all times starting from the policy level.

It is with some of those points in mind that the NGO forum recommends that the RGC should take DRR into account and consider mainstreaming it into the final draft of the NSDP update 2009-2013.

Specific Recommendations for the mainstreaming DRR into NSDP update 2009-2013 are:

- NCDM representative(s) should be part of the working group to prepare for NSDP update as well in order to assist the Ministry of Planning regarding DRR sector.
- Like with gender and other cross-cutting issues, there should be a clear mention of DRR consideration in design, implementation and evaluation of projects in all relevant sectors especially Education, Health, Local Administration, Agriculture Forestry and Fishery, Water Resources and Meteorology, Information, Land Management, Public Work and Transportation to minimize losses to investments due to disasters.
- The NSDP should be emphatic especially within the department of Metrology on the establishment of a robust but user-friendly early warning system.
- The NSDP should support establishment of properly mandated NCDM to enhance its coordination role for emergency response and disaster risk reduction.
- The NSDP should provide more support to NCDM for capacity building at national and local level disaster management committees through budget allocation.
- The NSDP should through the Ministry of Rural Development support design of tool for public awareness and building the capacity of Commune Council members and people in the community for them enable to analysis the risk and more resilient and better prepare for DRR
- The NSDP should through the Ministry of Planning and Ministry of Rural Development ensure that all the commune council will consider disaster risk reduction in developing the commune development plan (CDP). The CDP including DRR will be given the priority in the investment plan.

Suggested DRR Indicators: We would like to suggest indicators for the ease of DRR monitoring and measurement as follow:

- Province/District/Commune Investment Plan have integrated/integrated Risk Management (RM)
- New Project/programs have integrated RM
- DRR integration into school curriculum
- Early warning system effective where flood prone areas
- High risk communities have capacity regarding Early Warning (flood, drought, storm, human & livestock disease, pest infestation)
- Agriculture department have capacity to develop flood and drought resistance crop
- Multi-sector and multi-hazard Disaster Preparedness Plans developed and annually revised at provincial & district levels (including contingency planning)
- Effective & coordinated Disaster Response Preparedness mechanism established at all administrative levels
- Technical staff designated as focal points for DRR (& CCA) in all relevant Ministries (& Departments) at national and provincial levels
- Each NCDM Technical Working Group meets at least two times per year, and minutes disseminated to all relevant ministries focal points at national & provincial level
- National & provincial budget allocation for DRR (%) per ministry; and for NCDM
- Government & provincial expenditure on DRR (%) per ministry; and for NCDM

Key supporting Documents: Last, but not the least, we would like to attach two key documents which prepare by the NCDM with participation and support from relevant ministries and NGOs. Those key documents include:

1. Strategic National Action Plan for Disaster Risk Reduction, 2008-2013. In cooperation between National Committee for Disaster Management and Ministry of Planning in 2008
2. Initiative of Disaster Risk Reduction for integrating into National Strategic Development Plan Update 2009-2013. In cooperation between National Committee for Disaster Management and NGO partners in September 2009.

Contact Information:

For more information on the issue raised in this sectoral comments, please contact:

Oxfam-GB
Mr. George Were, Humanitarian Programme Manager-Oxfam.
TEL: (+855) 12 99 72 78
Email: Gwere@oxfam.org.uk

17. Education Sector

Page*	Para_number**	Original Text from the first draft NSDP Update 2009-2013	NGO Comment
56	202	Reducing Parental cost	Government to provide learning materials and assist marginalized families by continuing to provide scholarship for their children
	203	Eliminate unofficial payment	Increase teachers salaries to a level that they can live on, then disciplinary action will be taken on teachers charging unofficial school fees
57	203	5000 teachers will be recruited annually	Government is committed to recruit 5000 teachers annually
155	517	Incentives to teachers	Will give incentives to teachers which include monetary, in kind, training and promotion to higher grades based on merit and measurable performance.
156	517	Provide operational budget to schools	Increase operational budget to schools to meet the need of a school and simplify the requisition and reporting procedure.

* The page number refers to the page-number of the first draft NSDP Update 2009-2013.

** The para-number refers to the paragraph-number of the first draft NSDP Update 2009-2013.

Contact Information

For more information on this sectoral comments, please contact:

NGO Education Partnership (NEP)
 Mr. In Samrithy, Executive Director
 Tel: 023 224 774
 Email: info@nepcambodia.org or dir@nepcambodia.org
 Website: www.nepcambodia.org